

The Charismatic Movement is a Failure

I have written on the failings of the Charismatic Movement (CM) many times and exposed its heresies and bad practices. However, there is growing evidence today that many members of Charismatic churches (especially in America) are disenchanted and reconsidering their position. Now is a good time to produce a paper showing why the movement is a complete failure and a disastrous problem. I will endeavour to keep this to generalities; a paper dissecting their false doctrines, messy history and practices in detail would require many books (see my book, *Charismatic Catastrophe* for one example).

Note that I use the term CM sometimes to speak of the specific Charismatic Movement that emerged from 1960 onwards, but at other times it is an abbreviation (for brevity) for both the CM and the Pentecostal Movement which spawned it.

Historical background

You can find histories of the CM in many books and websites (or my book, *The Origins of Pentecostalism*), so we do not need to rehash details here.

The scandal of Pentecostalism

The origins of Pentecostalism lie in the 19th century, American, Wesleyan frontier revivals (where all sorts of odd behaviour was manifested),¹ the increasing secular interest in the paranormal and spirits (especially in America), mixed with the excesses of the US Holiness Movement, where tongues, trances and falling down first appeared in a large scale in the modern Christian world.² As the Holiness Movement dwindled, so Pentecostalism increased with some important leaders switching sides (such as Maria Woodworth-Etter).

When Pentecostalism began, at the beginning of the 20th century, it was the bad sheep of Christian denominations. Even up to the 1970s young believers would be warned by evangelical leaders to stay away from Pentecostals. There was good reason for this. The beginnings of it rested in scandals of all sorts. The Topeka Revival (where tongues first appeared in a woman in 1901), and the first Pentecostal leader, Charles Parham, fell into disrepute after Parham was arrested and charged with sodomy. He never fully recovered from this.

The origin of Pentecostalism

William Seymour was influenced by Parham and led the Azusa Street revival in 1906 (every excitable meeting was called a 'revival' then, after Finney's influence). This was also rife with scandal. Even Parham rejected it as full of witchcraft. It was really pandemonium³ in the literal sense. Meetings were wild, with mediums and witches conducting rituals so that people were scared. All sorts of occult type phenomena were occurring. It was so noisy and uncontrolled that Seymour put his head in a shoebox to pray. There was little preaching and no mature leadership. Read eyewitness accounts to see how shocking and sinful this origin of Pentecostalism was. Within a few years the Azusa Street ministry had split into

¹ Such as all the features found in the Toronto Blessing of the 1990s.

² Lots of heretical sects and cults in history have manifested tongues, prophecy, trances and falling over, but these were originally dismissed as false by the mainstream evangelical church.

³ 'Wild and noisy disorder or confusion'; based upon the original 17th c. sense of 'the place of all demons', in Milton's *Paradise Lost*. From pan = 'all' + *daimōn* = 'demon' [Greek].

factions with much rancour and malice, but not before the evils of it had been transported across the world where similar bad fruit also appeared.⁴

The evangelical reaction

The Christian world was shocked. People wrote books warning believers about its errors and excesses (such as, *The Tongues Movement* by eminent Brethren writer and missionary GH Lang). G. Campbell Morgan (precursor of Martyn Lloyd-Jones at Westminster Chapel) called early Pentecostalism, '*the last vomit of Satan.*'⁵ R.A. Torrey affirmed that the movement was, '*emphatically not of God, and founded by a Sodomite.*'⁶ H. A. Ironside said that the Holiness and Pentecostal movements were '*disgusting ... delusions and insanities*' and '*pandemonium's where exhibitions worthy of a madhouse or a collection of howling dervishes,*' were causing a '*heavy toll of lunacy and infidelity.*'⁷ W.B. Godbey went so far as to aver that Pentecostals were, '*Satan's preachers, jugglers, necromancers, enchanter, magicians, and all sorts of mendicants.*'⁸ The movement was condemned by virtually everyone: Baptists, Anglicans, Presbyterians, Independents, Congregationalists and Brethren.

Many writers noted the connection with the excesses of the Holiness Movement (where occultism had crept into Christian meetings, e.g. Maria Woodworth-Etter), the rise of Spiritualism, the rise of New Thought (again a syncretism of occultism and Christianity) and the evils of emotional revivalism (especially the excesses of Methodist revivals, such as Cane Ridge). Another major impact upon the origins of Pentecostalism was the 1904 Welsh Revival, which also had deteriorated into the worst excesses of emotionalism, superficiality and even demonic activity (see Jessie Penn-Lewis on this).

All these influences welded together to inculcate fleshly 'enthusiasm' (an old word meaning religious hysteria). Pentecostalism was merely debased, uncontrolled fleshly behaviour influenced by occultism in the garb of Christianity. Now this is not to say that there were no godly people in the movement, just as there are in any sect, but the origins of Pentecostalism are definitely occult and fleshly.⁹

Furthermore, the evil origins of the movement led to continual scandals amongst leaders. Now, any denomination can have scandal but all observers have confirmed that Pentecostalism has far more than anyone else by a long way. Shocking revelation appeared after shocking revelation. Adultery, fraud, alcoholism, homosexuality, lying to the press, perjury, fornication with prostitutes, fraudulent claims about miracles, use of actors to stage miracles, violence (even to church members) – the list is endless. Some scandals were so lurid that they were made into Hollywood movies.¹⁰ Aimee Semple McPherson even fabricated her own kidnapping to try to avoid an adulterous scandal. The sinful behaviour was also repeated everywhere that Pentecostalism went throughout the world.

It was for these reasons that young believers were always warned away from Pentecostals. And this is to say nothing of the terrible false doctrines that perpetrated the whole

⁴ The phenomena were similar to those found in the Toronto Blessing of 1994-6.

⁵ Michael L. Brown; *Holy Laughter to Holy Fire*, p197, 198. See also Fahy; *The Origins of Pentecostalism*.

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ Ibid

⁸ Ibid.

⁹ Classic evangelical Pentecostals (who are opposed to the modern Charismatic Movement) deny this; but I am afraid that the historical facts cannot be avoided. Neither are the key theological elements (e.g. tongues, baptism in the Spirit as an experience) Biblical.

¹⁰ See the film about Aimee Semple McPherson or the fictional *Elmer Gantry* (based on true characters).

movement (such as denial of the Trinity by some), or the aberrational practices that even included snake handling. We cannot list these here.

Latter Rain

Pentecostalism went radical in the late 1940s with the ‘Sharon revival’ in what is called the Latter Rain Movement. Though this was later outlawed by the Assemblies of God denomination, it had a lasting effect on Pentecostalism. This centred upon the rule in the church of authoritarian apostles and prophets, miracles, healing, deliverance from demons and vigorous musical praise (see appendix one). It featured many seriously false doctrines and leaders who were terrible charlatans. Out of this movement came heretic William Branham and the subsequent Healing Revival of the late 40s and 50s.

Now, that is all we can say in this short compass, but it is enough. To discover more read the sources mentioned.¹¹ In essence, the Pentecostal Movement was based on fleshly, emotionalism, occult phenomena, false doctrine, false worship, aberrational practices, sinful leadership and gullible manipulated people. Until 1960 it was the black sheep of the Christian church, a sect hidden away in England, with little influence on ordinary evangelicals.¹²

This all changed with the Charismatic Movement.

The Charismatic Movement

The history of the CM is well documented in many places and I cannot examine it here; even a summary would take too long.¹³ I just need to encapsulate the essential matters.

What happened was that, through various means, after 1960, Pentecostalism ceased being viewed with suspicion by Protestants and Catholics and it slowly entered into evangelical churches by stealth. First it came with the UK Renewal Movement where certain mainline institutional churches began to accept certain Pentecostal ideas and practices, notably the idea of a baptism in the Spirit experience producing tongues, which was supposed to lead to spiritual power and joy. The Fountain Trust (Michael Harper) was the gathering point for this, seeking to bring renewal everywhere, particularly in Anglican churches. Another Anglican, David Watson, was also a key figure in Cambridge and then York. The message was, ‘you don’t have to change your church to be like a Pentecostal church; you just need to experience the baptism of the Spirit like they did and speak in tongues’.

Then certain Brethren and Baptist churches began to accept Renewal after the conversion of their leaders to Pentecostal experiences, such as Harold Owen or Arthur Wallis. Some quite famous Baptists, such as David Pawson, became adherents to the CM. This was a period of open warfare between the Renewal party and the conservatives who opposed Pentecostalism. Thus John Stott stood against Renewal (forcing Harper from being his curate) but Lloyd-Jones equivocated (hoping it would be a return to Puritan practical godliness).

In this time some leaders converted to become hard Charismatics (the growing popular term which did not mention Pentecostalism), such as Gerald Coates, who was baptised in the Spirit while riding a bike. Others remained more subdued and continued leading in their normal manner (such as Peter Lewis who was baptised in the Spirit while preaching).

¹¹ Or see the writer’s *‘The Rescue Package: Charismatic Background’*.

¹² The two main Pentecostal churches were Elim and the Assemblies of God; both were small and not prominent up to the 1970s. Some smaller denominations, such as the Apostolic Church, had even fewer numbers. In reality, most evangelicals rarely came across Pentecostals.

¹³ For instance, see the works already mentioned of this writer.

The next event was a genuine move of God in about 1970 to convert huge numbers of young people, idealistic hippies and students. In America this was the 'Jesus Movement' and in Britain it led to the 'House Church Movement'. This was where I was converted. In our student union it was not unusual to see genuine converts pretty regularly, through friendly witnessing, which I thought was just normal Christianity at the time.

Many of these converts gathered into house churches so that hundreds of such churches sprang up all over Britain. Towns and villages in Britain suddenly had a new house church full of dissenters, comprising up to about 30 people. Some cities would have several completely independent home churches that had a more effective witness than institutional churches; some of these combined early on to meet in schools. It was common for these house churches to have an influence amongst the local Christian population way out of proportion to their membership.

Restorationism

What happened next was the appearance and development of the Restoration or New Churches.¹⁴ Gradually, throughout the 70s and early 80s, these house churches were mopped up and coalesced into one of the various Restoration churches. Several denominations of these arose, usually based on location: Harvestime under Bryn Jones in Bradford and the north; John Noble's groups in Essex, Gerald Coates' groups in Surrey, Peter Lynne's people in Bristol, G North's groups around London, Barney Coomb's church in Basingstoke and Fred Pride's church in the west country.¹⁵

In time these various groups (we have only named a few) coalesced again into hard denominations led by authoritarian leaders. The key ones are now Pioneer People (Coates' and Noble's groups), Ichthus (Roger and Faith Forster) in London, and NFI (Terry Virgo), plus some minor (but large) churches. These were given a shot in the arm by the appearance of John Wimber in the mid-80s and all joined the Signs and Wonders Movement, which itself developed into the prophetic movement and the exhibitionism of Toronto etc.¹⁶

During this development the general CM outside of Restorationism was considered weak while Restorationism was radical and powerful. The CM was an 'ism' accepted in an ad hoc way by individuals but Restorationism was Charismania built into churches under apostles and prophets, claiming to be more Biblical. What happened from the 80s onwards, and particularly in the 90s, was that the radicalism of Restorationism began to be accepted by the CM generally. In fact many Charismatics joined the Restoration denominations and large numbers of churches associated themselves with one or another apostle.

The CM take-over

As the Restoration churches appeared to be growing quite large, more and more conservative churches began to see that the only way to attract young people was to mimic the Charismatic churches. Over time, more and more churches (even those that had been opposed to the tenets of the CM) began to look like 'Charismania-lite'; they adopted CM songs, CM type music; CM type worship; CM style of meeting and CM strategies. They

¹⁴ These were churches adhering to Latter Rain ideas, especially the restoration of the church under apostles and prophets. The stream under Bryn Jones was called 'Restoration churches' (after their magazine title) while Gerald Coates coined the term 'New Churches' to avoid his stream being linked to Jones, following a split.

¹⁵ For more information see Peter Hocken: *Streams of Renewal*, Andrew Walker: *Restoring the Kingdom*, or my paper, *The British House Church Movement Of The 1970s, And its connection with the emergence of the Restoration Movement*.

¹⁶ Now called the New Apostolic Reformation.

pretended that they were true to Biblical doctrine but, in all every other respect, were just like Charismatic churches. Thus many in groups like the FIEC are now semi-Charismatic.

Therefore, the CM gradually took over most of the British church. Few hold out against this onslaught: some Particular Baptists, a very few Grace Baptists, some independent groups here and there, and some mainline institutional churches.

More recently there has been the development of Charismatics forming Jewish Root groups or Messianic Churches. These are usually opposed to Restoration or New Churches (chiefly for reasons of eschatology and the place of Israel in God's plan). There has also been a growth of Classic Pentecostal Black churches due to immigration; particularly in London; plus there are a number of independent Charismatic churches or imported denominations and organisations from America (e.g. Vineyard Churches and Word Faith groups) and Africa.

The net result

So, the net result was that what started out in life as a rogue version of aberrant Christianity, a sect associated with occultism and false doctrine, gradually took over most of the church after being transformed into the CM, which was just a Trojan Horse for Pentecostalism. Indeed, the worst features of Pentecostalism (Latter Rain) were the driving force of Restorationism, which was the most successful aspect of the CM in Britain.

I have spent more time on this than planned and must move to the purpose of this paper – to show why the CM has failed. My contention, in this paper, is that the CM is responsible for the massive degradation of the British church in multiple ways. Whatever factor you examine, it is in a much worse state now than it was 50 years ago. The CM is responsible for the gradual destruction of the evangelical church, which is what the satanic purpose was all along, aided by considerable investment by the global elite that seek to ruin Christianity.¹⁷

The failure of the CM vision

The vision for society

When the CM began it was in the idealistic days of the 1960s where flower power and hippie ideals were genuinely thought to be able to change the world for the better. The Altamont free concert put an end to the hippie ideal in 1969 and in the mid-70s we had Punk – the opposite of hippie ideals.

In the spirit of the 60s, the CM promised all sorts of benevolent benefits to society. Since it considered itself to be a revival (it was nothing of the sort) it hoped that it would ape the best features of past revivals which had influenced localities, such as pubs being empty in villages touched by the 1904 Welsh Revival.

Time after time, preacher after preacher expounded how the CM would change the world, how the world would become more Christian and more loving. Songs were written and sung vigorously about how Charismatics would change the world (such as '*World Changers*' or '*Build your church and heal this land*'). In fact, many of the radical Charismatics began to teach a global revival, beginning with John Wimber, where apostles and prophets would rule the world and the church would dominate all flesh.¹⁸ This was just

¹⁷ For details of the work and character of this elite see my paper, 'The Depths of Deception'.

¹⁸ Such as the Dreaded Breed / Joel's Army doctrine of Paul Cain and the Kansas City prophets – mere Latter Rain Utopian teachings (a revamped version of the 'Manifest Sons of God' teaching).

Latter Rain doctrine, which spilled out with the Signs and Wonders reliance upon heretics like Paul Cain and Bob Jones. Often, texts which refer to the end (e.g Acts 3:21; Isa 11:9; Hab 2:14) would be hijacked by CM preachers to mean a near golden age that would ensue when Charismatics were in the ascendancy. *Restoration* magazine took its name from a misinterpretation of Acts 3:21.

Pentecostals had also made a big feature of power being the result of a baptism in the Spirit or some other subsequent experience (such as 'a baptism of fire'). There was disagreement as to how this power came but everybody wanted it. The reason for wanting power was to manipulate the world (which is the basis of magic), such as by performing miracles to gain material influence or to heal the sick and change situations. Some claimed that apostles would use their power to kill opposers; other Latter Rain fools thought that their power would enable them to fly, and be invulnerable to bullets.¹⁹ Pentecostal power was going to change the world.

Originally, the Pentecostal idea about tongues was that it was not only the initial evidence but was also the gift whereby Pentecostals could preach in foreign lands without learning the local language. Missionaries actually went out unprepared only to come unstuck. This is just one example where Pentecostal power was thought to be able to change external situations. In general it was thought that whole CM churches filled with spiritual power would change towns and cities.

In other cases, more radical Latter Rain inspired Charismatics considered that they could change society by taking on the demons that ruled towns. All sorts of nonsensical shenanigans were developed that were founded on challenging local demons.²⁰ One of these methods was Praise Marches, developed by Graham Kendrick. This was not a demonstration of Christian unity but was originally developed to challenge demons. Other foolish notions arose including a whole theological movement based on spiritual warfare. The purpose was to change society by this or that method and ensure the reign of the CM.

CM leaders preached that the only answer for society was the CM. Note that there was less and less focus upon Christ by these churches but a focus on men and strategies. Thus: 'come to an Alpha course', 'come and see such and such preach', 'come and see signs and wonders', 'come and experience our amazing worship', 'come to a healing meeting', 'come and see such and such play music'.

Over and over again the CM was seen and proclaimed as the answer to the mess that society was in. Politicians could not solve societal evils, only the power of God through CM churches could do this great work. Ordinary churches could not do it, only CM churches. Only they had 'power'; the power manifested through the supernatural gifts of the Spirit.

The result

Well what actually happened?

Every society in every country got worse and worse and everybody knows it. The societies that got worse above all others were those where the CM was the strongest: America, Latin America, Africa, Britain etc.

¹⁹ Latter Rain developed at the same time that Superman was syndicated across US newspapers and when an array of super heroes arose in comics (such as the Justice Society).

²⁰ It is interesting that new CM ideas arise after an occult technique becomes fashionable. For instance, after the popularity of Feng Shui, certain Charismatics challenged a London council to remove all the pointed signs in the neighbourhood, claiming that this empowered demons and caused social problems and inspired violence.

It would just be too tedious to list example after example of why society is worse and surely this is accepted by all? Ask any old people that you know and they will tell you how much worse things are today. It is common for them to say that if they were younger they would not bring children into this evil world and how glad they are to be leaving it soon.

The main factor in the demise of society in the last 50 years has been the gradual erosion of the bedrock of Christian morality. This has been a deliberate assault by the enemy through the people that really rule the world above national governments; its purpose is to eventually destroy Christianity. So the demise was not just the loosening of ethical standards in general but a targeted attack on the Christian church and the Christian foundations of society. During the reign of the CM this attack has been very successful, so that even anti-Christian laws have been passed into national legislation. Far from the CM ushering in a utopian age, the very reverse has occurred. During its reign, the CM has presided over the ruination of Christian mores in society.

In the 1960s when the CM began in the UK life was a veritable golden age in comparison with the awful mess we are in today. In those days there was no major drug problem (the basis for most crimes) and there were no drugs in schools. In fact schools did not need a permanently residing policeman which they do today. People were generally polite and children were mostly still disciplined. Rape of the young and very old was exceedingly rare (it is now commonplace). England knew nothing of sex trafficking or slavery; there were no sex shops or lap-dancing clubs and strippers were not considered to be social advancement. Hard core pornography was extremely difficult to find; now pre-school children are familiar with it (with the resultant emotional consequences). Homosexuality is now an accepted, legalised lifestyle choice. Witchcraft covens proliferate across the land and many witches even have shops in high streets. Television now promotes the most extreme images of sex and violence, as well as being an effective propaganda tool for the ruling elite and liberal ideas. Christianity is publicly derided and misrepresented. We could go on and on but must stop.

The CM, after over 40 years, has done absolutely nothing to help society; in fact all societies are much worse than they were when the CM began. In this case the CM is an absolute failure.

The failure of evangelism and growth

I said earlier that I used to see regular conversions in the early 70s; it was just considered normal; that has long gone. Most Christians and churches now rarely see genuine converts who grow and remain. Yes there are groups that claim to see many converts, such as through the appalling Alpha Course, but on investigation we see that most of these are merely superficial professing believers – many of which fall away quite quickly.

Church decline in numbers

I maintain that it is now common that genuine converts are not appearing in the numbers that they used to. This is borne out by the church growth statistics over the last twenty years, which demonstrate the appalling decline of most churches in the UK. In the 90s churches were declining at the rate of 2,000 people a week! They are still declining today. Paganism is the fastest growing religion in Britain; while Muslims outnumber Christians in some northern towns.

In America in recent years 65 million have left the church, mostly leaders and mature members.²¹ This represents 31% of the US population. Most honest CM church leaders admit that their churches are like colanders, with many seeping out the back door. Mark Batterson, senior pastor of the large National Community Church admitted that he sees 40% attrition every year; 'We have to grow 40% to break even'.²² Statisticians are saying that 106 million Christians are expected to switch affiliation between 2010 and 2050 while only 40 million are expected to enter Christianity. Muslims are expected to equal Christians in the next few years and outnumber Jews in America.²³ 52,000 people leave the US church every week.²⁴

It is interesting that the reasons for this exodus are based on the lack of true Biblical church life. They are:

- *Lack of teaching*: They do not believe they are being told the truth about the Gospel and Bible teaching.
- *Lack of koinonia*: They do not believe that their church provides proper Christian fellowship and community.
- *Lack of nurturing*: They do not believe that their gifts are recognised or their spiritual purpose is being fulfilled.²⁵

These are the very things that the local church is supposed to provide; but it can only do so when the church is structured properly as: a small meeting in a home, centred upon love as a family, and led by a team of equal elders who preside over building people up with mutual edification.

This paper is not the place for extensive statistic detail.²⁶ However we can say that a study of New Zealand's Baptist churches is pretty typical; for every 100 new members 108 left with none being accounted for by dying or moving to another church. Pentecostal churches in New Zealand, despite an apparent dramatic growth, reveal that a steady 10% leave by the back door each year.²⁷ In America 3,000 churches vanish every year and 2.7 million church members fall into inactivity (i.e. leave the church). From 1990 to 2000, the combined membership of all Protestant denominations in the USA declined by almost 5 million members (9.5%), while the US population increased by 24 million (11%).²⁸ Census studies by Peter Brierley show that UK churches are virtually all in considerable decline and have been for 20 years. Between 1980 and 2005 (the period that the CM came to dominate the church landscape) Baptists lost over 32,000 (11%) while Independents lost nearly 50,000 (20.3%).

It is a myth that the people leaving are those on the fringes of church life or young aimless folk. Many people who have left the church were mature people, often families, who had

²¹ Sociologist Josh Packard PhD; 'Exodus of the religious Dones', [i.e. those who are 'done' with church], Group Pub. Inc. Loveland, Colorado, (2015).

²² Thom Schultz; Holy Soup, 'The Church's hidden back door', 22 July 2015.

²³ Business Insider, Matthew Speiser, 'Christians are leaving the faith in droves and the trend isn't slowing down', 28 April 2015.

²⁴ Godvertiser, 'The 3 top reasons why people are leaving the church', 10 March 2010.

²⁵ Ibid.

²⁶ See my paper, *An Honest Evaluation of Modern Reformed & Evangelical Churches and Proposals for the Future* for more information.

²⁷ Taylor L. "Denominational Growth" in Patrick B. (ed), *New Vision New Zealand Vol II*, Auckland, Vision New Zealand, (1997), p69.

²⁸ Dr. Richard J. Krejcir; *Statistics and Reasons for Church Decline*. Francis A. Schaeffer Institute of Church Leadership Development.

become terribly disenchanted. They had previously been very committed people, but left thoroughly disillusioned.

Superficial converts

Then if we look at the supposed success stories we see another problem – weak, superficial testimonies. The commonest methodology is the Alpha Course, now used by all denominations including Roman Catholics (that in itself is a problem). The conversions that come from this stable have been shockingly superficial. But what can we expect from a course that is weak on doctrine, weak on Biblical instruction, fails to highlight sin, mourning for sin, conviction and repentance. Instead it centres the attention on being lovingly received in communal meals (similar to the ‘love-bombing’ used by cults) and experiencing the Pentecostal power of the Spirit, which is just mystical passivity and emotionalism. Thus famous people were supposed to have been converted but soon left church and press investigators that had been ‘slain in the Spirit’ afterwards declared that they were still atheists.

Misunderstanding the Gospel

Charismatics that I talk to demonstrate, to a man, an ignorance of what the Gospel really is. We are not talking about justification or election (which they ought to understand) but basic doctrines of redemption and grace. Most have a view that includes variations of human merit being involved in conversion, or theologically, forms of Pelagianism. Arminians are among the better of them – that is how bad their understanding is. Even those few Charismatic churches which claim to be Calvinistic are actually Amyraldian, with shades of outright Arminianism. There is utter confusion about the Gospel.

Therefore, it is not surprising that I find many people in Charismatic churches are not genuine believers at all. I have talked to several experienced leaders about this and they all agree with me. It would not surprise me if 90% of those attending Charismatic churches were merely professing Christians in unbelief. It is for this reason that all Charismatic churches have issues with constant counselling and many have permanent counsellors on their teams. Various forms of counselling abound (many of them unbiblical) because the professing believers have multiple problems and fail in practical sanctification.

There was a time when evangelism was a key issue for conservative churches and leaders exhorted the people to get out there, evangelising friends and neighbours. As a result, a trickle of genuine converts appeared and were followed up effectively and added to the churches. People were involved and were the front line of witnessing. Under the CM evangelism became corporate; people were encouraged to bring folk along to special meetings where a professional evangelist, prophet or apostle would do the job. But that is a matter for the next topic.

Evangelism, in its purest sense, is a failure in Charismatic churches.

The failure of missions

Free-willism

One of the problems of the CM was its focus upon Arminian principles. Now this was to be expected since the background of Pentecostalism is Wesleyan Arminianism. However, the basis of almost all British churches, historically, had been Calvinism, though this position

had weakened over time.²⁹ British churches dismissed their heritage as they took on Pentecostal teachings in the CM.

Now some variants of the CM in later years emphasised their supposed Calvinism, such as Terry Virgo's NFI. However, in reality there was little real Calvinism in the teaching or practice and many individuals prattled outright Arminianism, or even Pelagianism,³⁰ in sermons. Even those individuals who wanted to be like Martyn Lloyd-Jones or CH Spurgeon preached Arminian principles in evangelistic messages. In reality, the whole CM was essentially Arminian in missionary methods – and this has led to severe weaknesses.

The invitation system

The invitation system (or 'Decisionism') is absolutely a form of practical Arminianism. It was first developed by Pelagian Charles Finney in 19th century American revivalism but spread over here through Crusade missions by famous evangelists like DL Moody or Billy Graham 50 years later.

In this system penitents indicate their desire for salvation by coming to the front and being counselled. If the counsellors didn't pressurise people for immediate submission that would not have been too bad; but pressure was always put on candidates to pray and 'accept Christ' with no appreciation of their true state.

In worse forms people did not even come forward for personal counselling but were prayed for en masse by the preacher. In yet worse forms people just raised a hand or stood up in their aisles and were globally prayed for or made to recite someone else's prayer.

None of these have any Biblical precedent and are guaranteed to produce false converts that were merely responding to the emotionalism of the moment. I have lost count of the number of people I have met that have fallen away from Christ who responded in this way.

The very idea that a man can pray for a candidate and get him to recite the prayer and expect a true conversion is utter nonsense. The idea of getting people to respond to an emotional call from the platform after a passionate appeal is foolish. Preaching may be an effective way of proclaiming the Gospel to large numbers but evangelism is by personal contact and someone can only be called 'saved' when genuine love for Christ, submission to the Gospel, repentance and conviction of sin has been evidenced. This cannot be done in the circumstances of an appeal in a crowded meeting with zero privacy.

Most evangelical churches had reacted against the invitation system that was practised by American crusade evangelists for decades³¹ but all these slowly began to accept the practice, as it was a central method within the CM.

The appeal system certainly builds up a lot of froth and bubble, but it is catastrophically useless at producing genuine converts. Even Charles Finney and the Billy Graham

²⁹ Most of the Baptist churches affected by the CM were from a conservative Reformed background (however some were Arminian (such as David Pawson). Congregationalists were originally Reformed. Most of the FIEC churches were loosely Reformed in theory. The Brethren were originally Calvinistic, though they later became Dispensational (as were Pentecostals). Even Anglicanism was originally Calvinistic, as the 39 Articles demonstrate. The most popular contemporary church leaders were essentially Reformed (such as Martyn Lloyd-Jones and John Stott). Many of the historical figures championed by the CM teachers were Reformed, such as CH Spurgeon, FB Meyer, and Andrew Murray. Hard-line Presbyterians would consider all these folk rather less than Reformed.

³⁰ I have personally witnessed a famous NFI worship leader preach outright Pelagianism in Virgo's flagship church in Brighton. He didn't even know he was doing it!

³¹ The Banner of Truth published books criticising it.

Organisation eventually had to admit that up to 90% of the converts later fell away. As this system dominated British churches through the CM, so it produced huge numbers of merely professing believers; and these still make up many of its members.

This system is one of the causes of the failure of modern British missions.

Corporate meetings instead of personal witness

The appeal system also led to the ruination of personal evangelism. Before the CM evangelism had been largely the practice of individuals evangelising friends and family, or sometimes strangers through missionary activities. What the CM churches began to do was to urge congregants to bring willing listeners to large meetings where it was thought that the impressive worship, entertainment and passionate preaching by a 'professional' would change their hearts.

Often these meetings had dedicated themes, such as a 'Gospel meeting' or a 'healing meeting' which were thought to have better chances at succeeding in evangelism.

Personal evangelism, though it continued to a certain degree, was largely sidelined. What was important was to get people in to large meetings and impress them. This is a reversal of the Biblical method, which is personal evangelism over a period of time by a trusted witness to Christ.

Reliance upon men

Another problem in this corporate mission activity is the reliance upon men. The CM generally has led to an elevation of men as superstars within the movement.

Now idolising men is always a danger for any church but the CM has made it an occupational hazard. Charismatic churches promote men and the men are idolised and submitted to without reservation. This is highly dangerous.

Most CM churches had some famous, idolised leader and he was thought to be able to do the job of mission better than anyone else – so, bring as many people as possible to hear him in a big meeting. If a local church did not have some superstar, then they imported one for the Gospel Meeting, and paid him handsomely for the privilege.

All of this denied the importance of many unknown but effective Gospel witnesses in the flock and led to idolising some special man. This is just sinful. No wonder modern churches are dwindling.

The lie of healing to evangelise

The birth of the Signs and Wonders Movement, largely by John Wimber but also a few others in the mid-1980s, led to another evangelistic lie. This was that if we performed a miracle or a healing upon a non-Christian, it would be much easier to then bring them to faith. This led to a whole new development of emphasis, and many broken hearts and depressions.

Again the danger of having a large emotional 'healing' meeting is always going to lead to false conversions where people respond rather to emotionalism and false expectations than the realisation of personal guilt that needs redemption.

Thus many people less effective at the false Charismatic 'healings' than the big names put all their attention on trying to work up mystical events rather than trusting in Christ. Many appalling abuses occurred when this was in its heyday from 1986 to the late 90s. For example, in one famous Brighton Charismatic church an old lady on crutches with her legs

in plaster was shooed off the stage and denounced as having no faith for healing when she did not respond to prayer. Shameful!

I also know of many sad cases where individuals tried to heal people in shops and on the streets off the cuff and all failed miserably.

As usual, if a few people fell over or had legs 'lengthened'³² meetings were called a success. In reality no one was ever healed to my knowledge (and I witnessed many such events).³³ All tests done on Charismatics and Pentecostals by Christian professionals have revealed no miracle cures ever. In fact, many have died after being proclaimed healed.

Whatever the facts about fraud, fakes, lies, or just good wishes, the real issue is that this whole premise is unbiblical. God does not bless or heal non-Christians. His word categorically states that God does not give grace to unsaved people that are not elect.³⁴ Furthermore, there is no precedent for the church to expect to heal sinners in order to gain an effective hearing for the Gospel. [The case of the apostles of Christ and Paul doing miracles was to authenticate their credentials as men from God in the initial proclamation of the Gospel. It was not a model for the church for evermore (Heb 2:3-4).]

This practice also led to multitudes of false believers.

Sheep stealing

The early success stories of the large Charismatic churches were down to several things other than evangelistic success.³⁵ Of these the most prominent factor was taking existing disciples from other local churches, causing the churches to eventually to disappear.

This was a charge that was commonly heard where CM churches operated and it was always denied. However, it was true whether the CM leaders accepted it or not, whether they deliberately targeted folk or not. Everyone of us present at the time knows that this is true.

Sadly, there were deliberate strategies by some unscrupulous leaders to steal sheep. Wimber himself often planned his conferences to do this very thing for example.³⁶ In fact the establishment of his original church was the result of stealing people from a church he previously worked with. However, I believe that most British CM leaders did not actively

³² This is supposed to be a cause of back-pain. One leg is supposed to be lengthened to balance gait. However, this is a common confidence trick and is just the manipulation of the legs to appear so. Yet one or two people believe that they have benefited from this, which I attribute to raised endorphins and adrenaline due to the highly charged event.

³³ In the first John Wimber conference in Brighton I was involved in praying for a two women in wheelchairs. The first had some measure of healing and got out of her wheelchair and helped me pray for the other woman. However, I know nothing about the woman's condition or if she merely had temporary pain relief (which is common). The second woman was a severe case of paralysis and I prayed with this woman till after midnight long after the meeting closed. Though she had much beneficial therapy (she would convulse while I was praying which she said was similar to what her therapist did) I had to leave her still paralysed (though she was thankful). This set me thinking.

³⁴ E.g. Jn 9:31, 'God does not hear sinners'. Ps 34:16, 'The face of the LORD is against those who do evil'. Prov 15:29, 'The LORD is far from the wicked, but He hears the prayer of the righteous'. Prov 28:9, 'One who turns away his ear from hearing the law, even his prayer is an abomination'.

³⁵ Such as establishing churches in towns with a large student population. Students, who are often vulnerable people away from home for the first time and very lonely, are easy prey for love-bombing religious groups that entice them in large numbers.

³⁶ Whistle-blowers had exposed the strategy to hold a 'Power Conference' in the centre of a number of churches likely to have young believers that would be attracted to the music, practices and teaching. After the conference, a church would be formed to gather these young people.

plan to do this, it just resulted from the way that they organised – offering an exciting new form of church in their conferences, celebrations and Bible weeks that local small churches could not hope to copy. However, Bryn Jones' and Terry Virgo's early message of, '*Come with us and we will do you good*' does appear to be cynical in hindsight.

What would tend to happen was that young people in several local churches would be attracted to the form of the Charismatic meeting modelled in local celebrations or Bible Weeks. This would pre-eminently use the Charismatic, rock music, worship attraction more than anything else. Local small churches, some with no musicians at all or just an old lady playing a pedal organ, and singing very old songs, could not compete with CM churches with a loud folk-rock band, a winsome worship leader, modern format easy to sing choruses and the whipped up emotionalism of a Victorian period revival. Students and the young flocked to the new CM church in the area, severely depleting the local churches. Over time, older folk joined them. With no young blood and no one to replace retiring pastors, many of these local churches just collapsed; some continued in a very depleted state. Churches that had stood for centuries suddenly disappeared.

Without a doubt, the early CM period involved a great deal of growth by sheep-stealing (either deliberate or accidental) and ruined many small churches. This is not a success story but a tragedy.

Missionary collapse

As the CM grew, the trustees of various missionary societies began to complain of a very reduced level of giving. At first they did not know why, but it gradually became clear that the money of many Christians was being given as a priority to CM church leaders.

The development of the CM churches was very different to historical local churches. The larger CM churches needed to buy new premises at huge costs due to the larger numbers in the congregation. It was common that a church would pay over a £1 million for a building and perhaps many hundreds of thousands for refurbishment. Such big buildings would then require large amounts for constant maintenance, council tax, utility bills, and improvement.

On top of this, instead of the traditional single pastor on a salary, CM churches would often have large numbers of paid workers. The leadership would be very highly paid, as opposed to the low wages traditional churches usually offered. Then there would be many full-time leaders as well as the top rank. In addition there would be office staff of various sorts to cope with the marketing methods used by CM large churches: administrator, conference manager, secretaries, recording manager, building manager, marketing manager, music manager and so on. All these resulted in a very high wages budget.

Thus CM churches initiated huge drives for money; constant demands to help the ministry. Sermon after sermon taught that giving to the church was the highest priority, when the Bible teaches that giving is to the poor and needy. It developed a very legalistic teaching on tithing, which was completely unbiblical and contrary to their teaching about legalism. Members were made to feel very guilty if they did not give all that they could (and more) to the church; many demanded that tithes be of the gross salary figure rather than net.³⁷

³⁷ If a low earner gives 10% of his gross wage to a church, and then 20+% in income tax and more on National Insurance, there is not much left. If his rent or mortgage goes up he only has food and utilities that he can cut back on. I knew many families that struggled to survive because they tithed or had monthly overdrafts that equalled their tithe.

As a result poor members often suffered as they thought they were serving God by giving sacrificially to further the ambitions of men. I know of many families that suffered through detrimental tithing.

The upshot of all this was that the giving to missionary societies dwindled severely. Some collapsed; others cut back activity. To make matters worse, the CM began to develop its own missionaries to plant new churches after its own image. Thus any call to give to missions meant that most people (the CM churches had the biggest church population by the 1980s) would only mean giving to the mission activity of your CM church, rather than supporting a historical missionary society.

The CM caused a severe loss of funds to historic missionary societies.

Overall, the mission activity of the CM has been a failure. It has depleted historic missions and focused members on unbiblical methods. The fact that the British, committed Christian population is declining is proof.

The failure of church separation

The church is the apple of God's eye because it is the body of Christ, God's beloved Son. Thus the church must be pure and unsullied. This requires separation from everything else. The true church has no need for partnership with anything whatsoever.

The local church is the microcosm example of this; it is the church in the locality representing Christ and a part of the universal body. Any joining with some other body is corruption and iniquity. The independence of the local church is vital, though informal relationships with other pure churches, and shared ministry, have value.

The mystery

The Gospel is a mystery – a secret hidden from men but revealed by God to his chosen ones and entered into by faith.³⁸ Various aspects of the Gospel are a mystery. The mystery of God is that both the Father and Christ are God.³⁹ The mystery of election is that it encompasses Gentiles as well as Jews.⁴⁰ The mystery of marriage is that it is a symbol of Christ's relationship to the church.⁴¹ The mystery of Christ is: Jesus is God in human form.⁴² The mystery of God's purpose is that the church should be the manifestation of God's character.⁴³ The mystery of godliness is: Christ in us the hope of glory and God manifested in the flesh through Christ.⁴⁴ The mystery of the body is: us in Christ, the hope of eternal life.⁴⁵ We are stewards of these mysteries in the church, *'Let a man so consider us, as servants of Christ and stewards of the mysteries of God'*, (1 Cor 4:1). This is how we are to be considered, especially leaders, 'stewards of God's mystery'.

Thus there is a sense in which the church, and the purpose of the church, is hidden from the world. The church is separate from the world and has nothing to do with the world. It is a mystery to the world.

³⁸ 1 Cor 2:7; Eph 1:7, 6:19; 1 Tim 3:9; Matt 13:11; Lk 8:10.

³⁹ Col 2:2.

⁴⁰ Eph 3:3, 6.

⁴¹ Eph 5:32.

⁴² Eph 3:4; Col 4:3.

⁴³ Eph 3:9-10.

⁴⁴ Col 1:26-27; 1 Tim 3:16.

⁴⁵ Eph 1:9 with 22.

The negative mystery

But there is also a negative mystery – the mystery of lawlessness.⁴⁶ This is when Satan invades the church (and mankind generally) at the end times and dominates the superficial, physical expression of it, reversing all God’s characteristics.⁴⁷

There is a time when many fall away from grace at the end and the external church is compromised and corrupted; utterly ruined, as Satan completely takes it over and thinks that he has beaten God. Through the proxy of the man of lawlessness, the man of sin, Satan captures the church and sits in God’s visible temple.⁴⁸ Man as God’s chosen vessel, his temple, is taken over by Satan as man expresses complete lawlessness.

We are seeing at least the beginnings of this fulness of satanic expression in mankind and in the church before our very eyes.

The cause of corruption

The development of the CM ruined the separation of the church in the world, both by deliberate stealth and by sincere, but foolish, partnerships. In fact, it is safe to say that the CM has been the prime cause of ecumenism, and association with Roman Catholicism in particular, for fifty years.

Like Pandora’s box, the CM has opened the lid to all sorts of evils to be let loose within the church through evil association. It led to a great falling away and ecumenism.

Experience over truth

When you want to affirm the unity of believers in Christ the only way to secure that is with the truth. Anything less than truth is very dangerous because it cannot be absolute. Only the truth of God’s word is an absolute to secure unity. We are fellow workers – for the truth (3 Jn 1:8); we walk together - in truth (3 Jn 1:3-4); we love each other – in the truth (3 Jn 1:1).

Thus, for an example, one cannot ally with Roman Catholics because their doctrine denies the truth in multiple ways. Just one case is that Catholic doctrine declares that all who believe in justification by faith (the heart of the Gospel) are anathema and doomed to hell. Allying with someone who affirms that is blasphemous because it denies God’s word on a cardinal issue.

The massive lie promoted by the CM was that it is not truth that cements relationships but a shared experience or a shared life. Now, no one can be certain that a person is saved because we cannot know someone’s heart. So allying with someone who says that they are a Christian, without evidence (such as obedience to the truth) is dangerous. I have lost count of the number of supposed Christians who later turned out to be apostate; and that includes many leaders.

The big focus for CM unity is therefore the baptism in the Spirit; trusting in this mystical experience determines the basis of unity for the CM. This has been affirmed time after time by CM leaders. In reality, the only evidence for this is speaking in tongues. Not only have they joined with apostate people because they affirmed a baptism in the Spirit experience, but in some cases they related to the apostate as the senior partner (for example Roman Catholics).

⁴⁶ 2 Thess 2:7.

⁴⁷ 2 Thess 2:3-4, 9-10.

⁴⁸ We have no space here to debate whether this is a corporate man of sin or a specific individual. I favour a corporate man.

The fallacy of this is that the basic experience regarded as the baptism in the Spirit (often associated with tongue speaking or falling down) is common in cults, sects, the occult and false religions. Witches often speak in tongues, occult cults speak in tongues; oriental groups speak in tongues, indeed mad people speak in tongues. Many cults have an experience identical to the supposed baptism in the Spirit; are Christians supposed to ally with them?

The idea that a mystical experience is the ground of unity between Christians and others is just about as stupid as it gets. But this is what has happened over the last 50 years.

Examples of ecumenism

Now this is not the place to give a detailed analysis of this but further information can be found in one section of my paper 'Charismatic Catastrophe', 'The Degradation of Inter-Church Relationships'. I will just give bullet points for simplicity, adapted from this paper.

Association with Rome

- Pentecostal churches have long had close ties with the Roman Catholic church, the most formal official connection being that of David du Plessis; three popes received him as a supporter of worldwide ecumenism. He engineered the development of a Pentecostal-Roman Catholic dialogue subsequent to his invitation to Vatican II. This significant Vatican Council (1962-5) was the springboard for Catholics to get involved with Charismatics as it accepted the importance of the gifts of the Spirit, after a defence by Cardinal Suenens.⁴⁹
- The Fort Lauderdale Five, in particular Derek Prince, had a formal strategy (kept secret at the time but now revealed in published minutes) to bring evangelical Charismatics into relationship with Rome after an alliance made with cardinal Suenens in 1977.⁵⁰ It was considered at the time that Catholics were more advanced in renewal than evangelicals (especially in deliverance ministry, which was a key feature of the Ft Lauderdale men), and that it would be advantageous for there to be a crossover by developing informal ties with Spirit-filled Roman Catholics. A hidden policy of easing in Romanist influences was agreed but kept secret since many Charismatic leaders in the UK were ardent anti-Romanists. Suenens even got the group to consider a joint project with the purpose of training men to be ordained into the Roman Catholic priesthood and diaconate.⁵¹
- There was a close connection of the early UK Charismatic renewal pioneers (like Michael Harper) with Roman Catholics; which troubled Martyn Lloyd-Jones. Michael Harper was happy for converts to be sent to Catholic churches and called himself, 'a *Catholic, Evangelical Charismatic*'.
- There was a close connection between the March For Jesus rallies of Graham Kendrick and Roman Catholics.
- There was a close connection between John Wimber and Roman Catholics. Catholic books, like those of the Dominican Francis MacNutt, were recommended and sold at Wimber's conferences. Wimber averred that: the Pope is a born again evangelical who preaches the Gospel clearly. He accepted Catholic miracles, like those at Lourdes

⁴⁹ The beginning of the Catholic renewal was the formation of a prayer group at Duquesne University, Pittsburgh, in 1967; however, many individual Catholics had been baptised in the Spirit much earlier.

⁵⁰ *Meeting of The Council*, [minutes] January 3-7, 1977, Ft. Lauderdale, FL Regarding Suenens, the minutes show a formal link - 'We wish to establish a committed relationship with the Cardinal for certain specific functions to be determined mutually ... We, as a Council, are committing ourselves to work together with the Cardinal ... in projects to be mutually agreed upon.' [*Minutes/Council/May-June, 1977* page 3]

⁵¹ *General Council Meeting -5- Aug. 8-10, 1977; III.A.2.*

attributed to Mary. He was also re-married in a Catholic church. He wrote for Roman Catholic magazines, one article was called *'Why I Love Mary'*, (New Covenant Magazine, June 1988). Wimber also accepted the use of Catholic relics (human remains and other objects) to bring healing (Wimber, *Church Planting Seminar*, Tapes 1,2,3,4,5. March 1981).

- Through Wimber, formerly Protestant CM leaders, like Terry Virgo, became linked with Roman Catholics. Virgo organised the ecumenical Brighton 91 Conference, for example.⁵²
- Senior Papal ministers shared platforms at the International Charismatic Consultation on World Evangelism alongside Archbishop George Carey, Graham Kendrick, Terry Virgo, Michael Green, Michael Harper, Larry Christenson, Vinson Synan, Jack Hayford and Kriengsak Chareonwongsak. David Watson called the Reformation a mistake while Michael Green considered the most reverent aspect of the conference to be a Catholic Mass.⁵³
- Cardinal Basil Hume was called to address the Baptist Assembly. David Coffey publicly recognised the *'deep spirituality'* which undergirded Hume's ministry. The cardinal had been invited as a result of the Union's president's (Douglas McBain) close friendship with Hume.
- The Evangelical signatories to the *Evangelicals and Catholics Together* (ECT) statement were Charismatics or Charismatic supporters.

How can any believer have public fellowship with a man who believes and teaches that the Pope is infallible, that Mary is to be worshipped as a mediator to God, that purgatory exists, that Christ must be re-sacrificed at every mass, that penance deals with sin and much more.

Association with others

- Mormons gathered in Promise Keeper meetings with Evangelicals, sometimes in force at stadium events. Promise Keepers literature became the only evangelical books ever to be displayed in Mormon bookshops and tabernacle bookstalls.
- Charismatic vicars have conducted joint meetings with representatives of Hinduism, Islam and others. The praises of Krishna have been sung within Christian churches. This is idolatry of the first order.
- The Jewish Root Movement has led many Messianic CM churches into direct links with Jewish organisations, the Israeli government and even Jewish terrorists. Jewish Root church leaders have even signed agreements not to evangelise Jews in the false belief that they are saved by just being Jews. This is despite the fact that almost all modern Jews have no ancestral link to Abraham through Jacob; indeed over 90% are not even Semitic.⁵⁴

Quotes regarding open ecumenism

The reformation quarrel with Roman Catholics is no longer relevant.⁵⁵

Preach the gospel, but don't be so negative as to refuse to endorse or work with those who belong to a group that proclaims a different gospel.⁵⁶

⁵² See my paper, 'Unholy Alliances'.

⁵³ *The Brighton 91 Interviews*, WPU (Inc), Peacehaven (1991), in. loc.

⁵⁴ See my book, 'The Depths of Deception'.

⁵⁵ Gerald Coates; 'Coates in Westminster,' *Adullam Register*, pamphlet, July 1997.

⁵⁶ Leighton Ford, Billy Graham Organisation. *The Berean Call*, May 1998.

I admire Pope John tremendously ... I felt he brought a new era to the world.⁵⁷

Pope John Paul II is one of the greatest moral and spiritual leaders of this century. He is an evangelist.⁵⁸

It is my hope that this proposed project will result in substantial reconciliation between the major monotheistic faiths.⁵⁹

Roman Catholics into the charismatic renewal ... are way ahead of many Protestants in this regard; we Protestants are learning much from them.⁶⁰

Ecumenical gatherings bless all who participate.⁶¹

The reason why I ... related to the Roman Catholics was because I saw that they had the same experience that I had, of the baptism of the Spirit ... the basis of fellowship is not primarily doctrine, it is those who God has drawn into his fellowship.⁶²

Conclusion

Ecumenical attempts had been largely resisted by evangelicals up to the 1960s. The developing World Council of Churches included some Protestant institutions but most evangelicals were firmly against it.

This changed after the CM progressed. Through the false Pentecostal experience (baptism in the Spirit) many evangelicals were lured into associations with Catholics and others on the basis of a common spiritual experience, something that could never be verified as genuine. Over time the alliances based upon CM alliances pervaded almost the whole British evangelical church scene.

As a result, we can safely say that the CM has completely failed to protect the separation of the church and has fed the Lord's people to the wolves by inviting the wolves into the flock.

The failure of personal spiritual development

This is one of the greatest sins of the CM. Its focus upon emotionalism, mysticism, authoritarianism and entertainment has led to a superficial brand of Christianity that has failed its members.

Historically, small churches led by a godly man ensured that members were nurtured and cherished so that they grew in sanctification and theological knowledge. Many churches actively catechised new converts to establish them in doctrine and godly principles – since the CM began that has been abandoned. Some more authoritarian churches (like NFI) replaced a catechism centred on basic Biblical doctrine with a 'commitment course' (that tells you their focus) which made sure that members were really committed to their core values and promised to be submissive to leaders.

⁵⁷ Chicago Tribune, 8.6.63.

⁵⁸ *Saturday Evening Post* article by Graham, Jan/Feb 1980.

⁵⁹ Lyn Green, Head of YWAM (UK); referring to the 'Reconciliation Walks around the Middle East engaging in 'identificational' repentance to purge the sin of Christians during the Crusades. *Contending Earnestly For the Faith*, 4.2, p9.

⁶⁰ Derek Prince; *Sword & Trowel*, 1997.2.

⁶¹ Derek Prince; *General Council Meeting* [of the Fort Lauderdale Five] -3- Aug. 8-10, 1977; III. A. 4.

⁶² Michael Harper; *The Brighton 91 Interviews*, WPU (Inc), Peacehaven (1991), p15.

Failure of eldership

The prime responsibility of elders is to be like a father to the flock, ensuring that members were spiritually nourished. Charismatic churches, especially the Restorationist variety, replaced small meetings with large ones, simple leadership with a complex hierarchy, and devolved responsibility to unbiblical people. Thus Charismatic elders were removed from being fathers and were more like business leaders or executives in a corporation.

Separation of leaders

It has become common that CM leaders are very distant from their congregation; indeed I have heard stories that it is not only difficult to see a leader but they don't even answer letters. The congregation became simply a resource to be used rather than a family to be nurtured with leaders becoming a sanctified elite, not to be disturbed.

I can imagine some elders protesting this; indeed some CM full-time elders did try to be a proper pastor. Nevertheless, the sheer facts are multiple complaints from every direction that key leaders were unapproachable. In a pyramid hierarchy where the top man dominates policy, it matters little that a lower leader is approachable if you really need to speak to the top man to complain about the church direction. It is these people especially that are hard to get hold of.

Delegation to the wrong type of leader

Charismatic leaders are above menial matters and expect spiritual guidance to members to be carried out by home-group or cell-group leaders. These may not have the necessary gifting, ability, knowledge or experience to do this task, but they are also working men who do not have the time (on top of family cares) to do this work.

Many CM leaders delegate the responsibility for spiritual guidance and training to paid counsellors, many of whom are women that have been trained by the ethos of a pagan psychological system (see 'counselling' later). Apart from that, it is unbiblical for a woman to have spiritual authority over a man.

Neglected ministries

After ten years with a famous apostolic CM church I saw first-hand how the life was squeezed out of church members, with the most zealous and willing being crushed first. Scores of men left this church over the decades and formed their own churches, ministries or missions, proving that they had a ministry – yet they were virtually ignored or put down in the apostle's work.

The wrong men

The reason for this is, like businessmen and politicians, the apostles promoted 'Yes-men', loyalists⁶³ that would not rock the boat or threaten their leadership. Gifted, experienced and qualified men with independent thinking were ignored for full-time work, while unqualified but unthreatening, malleable men were given jobs. The focus was on submission rather than gift. This is a recipe for disaster in terms of pastoral work. If your pastor cannot pastor and your teacher cannot teach, what chance do you have.

One famous worship leader was put in charge of pastoring while the apostle was away for a time. It was an absolute disaster, as we knew it would be, because this man could not do the job. After six-months he joked about it saying that he had left a trail of destruction behind him; but it was no joke for the scores of people whose lives were messed up. This also shows the complete lack of wisdom in the decisions of the 'apostle'.

⁶³ I do not mean to impugn the men themselves, many of them were very nice people (indeed, friends); they just were not gifted as leaders or teachers. Their chief characteristic was loyalty to the apostle.

The wrong focus

The focus for church members in these works is: attendance at meetings (which takes priority over other issues, such as family); giving your money to the apostolic work and unthinking submission to the leadership. In practice, ordinary working folk just don't have any time to do necessary things, like strengthening the family, responsibilities to wider family, developing your prayer life, studying Scripture etc. In short, personal spiritual development falls apart.

For these reasons CM churches have led to a weaker and weaker church membership. Frequently I am told by friends that they made contact with someone still in a Charismatic church that they haven't seen for many years. They all say the same – the person has not changed or developed in that time. They have remained dull and have made no spiritual progress. CM churches stifle personal growth. It makes the original claim, '*Come with us and we will do you good*', a hollow promise. As one ex-Charismatic friend said to me, '*CM churches need to carry a government health warning*'.

The ability of CM churches to develop discipleship and promote spiritual growth is an utter failure. This is why many are leaving the work.

The failure of community

There are two sides to this matter: the first is ignoring fellowship (*koinonia*) almost completely while the other is overstating community so that the church becomes a virtual social club and not a church. The majority of CM churches fall into the former category while the 'Community' and 'Emerging' churches fall into the latter.

The Biblical focus

The chief principle of the local church is fellowship. While the church is centred in the meeting upon the Lord's Supper, the driving principle is *koinonia*. Search the NT and you will find that the reason for gathering together is not to worship but to mutually encourage one another, to edify one another. The whole basis of church life is one anothering, fellowshiping, loving, caring and nurturing. Deep down every Christian knows this even if they cannot articulate the doctrine. The basis of Biblical teaching is edification. The basis of spiritual gifts is encouraging the body. Eventually, when people feel that they have been failed in this matter they leave the church, deeply disaffected.

Centrality of leaders

What the CM did was to re-invent church. Instead of the body being central, the leadership elite became central. What was vital for a church was an apostle to dominate or a prophet to claim a higher revelation. Sheer elitism; which led to cultic organisations.⁶⁴ If your chief leader talks to God and gets church policy direct from heaven, then you haven't got much of a purpose – you are just a cog in his big machine. Worse, if you think that the church direction is wrong, then how can you challenge what an apostle has affirmed is God's will? This sort of conundrum has broken people's faith.

Two wrong foci

Corporate worship

The CM led to the centralising of church on to two things. The first was the worship time, which was the main attraction. This gradually became a form of mere entertainment based upon emotionalism, sloppy superficial songs, and even mystical passivity. It was a feelings-

⁶⁴ Of course this has happened before in certain institutional churches, but the CM was a very severe form of this.

led, weekly jamboree that became like a drug that folk could not do without. I have known disaffected families leave a CM church in disgust, only to return a few months later because they needed the experience of the worship time. This shows a lack of character. The errors, wrong practices and maltreatment that drove them away were ignored so long as they could have a weekly jamboree.

But this was a corporate activity that was dominated and led by a worship leader. No matter how moving it may be, it was not body ministry. Indeed, participation of members in the meeting became smaller and smaller. This was worsened by the meetings becoming bigger and bigger with large numbers in the congregation preventing any meaningful mutual ministry. Corporate worship times dominated by a loud band, led by a worship leader ruined 'body-ministry'. Biblical mutual edification, which the original UK House Church Movement brought to the fore, was destroyed by the formal large churches of the CM.

The sermon as a propaganda tool

The second matter of focus is the sermon, usually preached by someone in authority; often the star leader of the church. Again the NT gives no precedent for this domination of half of the meeting by a formal speech given by the same man week after week. I know that most churches do this, but at least historic churches based their messages on edifying the flock; often with a continuing study of a Bible book.

The CM churches tended to use sermons as propaganda tool to put over official church policy. Thus many sermons were devoted to the issue of raising money for the latest harebrained scheme. I know one person who visited a certain famous CM church occasionally for family reasons. She was shocked that every time she visited the sermon was a demand for money, even from non-members.

Leaders may complain to me that they do indeed preach Biblical subjects. Well, if that is true why is the CM church population so spiritually ignorant? Why are multiple heresies raging in every CM church? Why do Charismatics not know what the Gospel is? Why is there no doctrinal development? Why are false teachers recommended, lauded and given platforms? Why are obvious fallacies and awful heresies not noticed? Bible and doctrinal subjects are not being taught properly; the flock is not being edified and is not being renewed in knowledge.

So, the centrality of a ruling elite in the church structure, coupled with meetings being dominated by a wrong worship and a propagandising sermon, led to the abandonment of body-ministry. Most people in CM churches today have no clue what body-ministry is and have never seen it in operation. The CM took the body-ministry of the House Church Movement (its foundation) and destroyed it. They took all the principles of the local church and turned the local church into a celebration.⁶⁵

The focus upon men

In simple terms, one of the chief failures of the CM is its focus upon men rather than Christ first and the Lord's flock second. It's all about men and authoritarian leadership systems. This centring upon men must always destroy any focus upon people and mutual edification.

⁶⁵ 'Celebration' was the word given to early Charismatic regional meetings where a number of churches would come together for a jamboree and a sermon by a nationally famous name. They were used as a honey pot to entice churches and individuals to join an apostolic group. When they served their purpose, they ceased. They were common in the 70s when apostolic churches were getting off the ground.

Community based CM churches

Now Christians have a gut feeling about all this, even if they are theologically immature. Over time there was a reaction against this professional, highly organised, formal, heavily led type of church life. Gradually new types of CM churches and movements began to appear which centred upon community.

Thus we now have local 'community churches' where community is the main purpose and also the 'Emerging Church', which is an entirely new form of CM church that is Postmodern, democratic, informal, unstructured and devoid of Biblical authority.

These churches vary significantly. Some meet in pubs and have become little more than a talking shop. Some have become glorified social clubs. Some have a coffee bar and kids playground in operation, with people talking and making noise, while the main church body tries to worship. Some have even turned the church meeting into a place for hobbies so that people knit, or crochet, during the proceedings; mutual edification being no longer sharing about Biblical matters but hobbies.

The problem is that these have gone too far in the opposite direction and have ceased to follow Biblical guidelines about meeting together, such as being centred upon the Lord's Supper with reverence or the need to teach and nurture members with Biblical knowledge. In church personal expression is not about me sharing what I am in the flesh but what I am in Christ under the control of the Holy Spirit.

Conclusion

Today we have two types of CM failure of community and fellowship. The majority of CM churches have just destroyed all forms of body-ministry and any idea of mutual edification. Church gatherings are formal, heavily-led, and structured in a worship/sermon format.

The minority includes community churches and Emerging Churches where informality, people-centred, unstructured, fleshly activity dominates.

Both have destroyed proper Biblical community, fellowship and body ministry.

The CM has utterly failed to implement Biblical fellowship and community.

The failure of giving

The poor and needy

The prime target for the giving of the saints in the NT is the poor and needy. There is some giving to leaders who are so busy in the word that they cannot be expected to work. In reality this usually only applies to itinerant ministers who are fully occupied with preaching the Gospel and travelling. If the Biblical form of church and leadership is followed (home churches with a small eldership team) then full-time ministry is never necessary (or very rarely). However, if a man is called to teach to help a number of struggling churches that have no teachers, then it is possible that he may need support.

This support is not a salary but the response to divine constraint upon the faithful prayer of the leader. It is the responsibility of the leader to make his needs known to God (not men) and to trust in divine provision. Thus there are no salaries and no constant calls for money. Paul models the leader who was entitled to support and yet often took no support but supported both himself and his colleagues by tent-making whilst on preaching tours.

Outside of a very few leaders, the bulk of the church's giving is to the poor people in the church followed by the poor people who are the church's neighbours. Charitable giving, both in terms of money and in practical help, is the key way that the church serves the local community and prepares the way for the Gospel to be heard. The charity of the local church establishes character in the eyes of the world and leads them to trust the church's preaching.

Before the CM, living by faith was generally something that went on in the independent, Baptist, Congregational and Presbyterian churches (most of which are now gone in their old forms). Institutional mainline churches (Anglicans, Methodists and Catholics) usually had salaries and incumbencies.⁶⁶ Some of them had salary schemes but in every other way fitted in to the Biblical norm. Charitable giving was commonplace, not only in monetary terms but also in the provision of soup kitchens, aid work, youth work and caring services. In fact, in the independent churches, it was often the case that leaders were poorly paid and that full-time evangelists struggled to make ends meet living by faith (I don't endorse this).

A Biblical principle of leadership is that the shepherd should live at about the same average level as his flock. He is part of the flock under God and is delegated to serve the people in serving God; he is one of them. Jesus modelled this; in fact Jesus had less than his followers, having no home to rest his head. Paul also modelled this and also had no permanent home of his own.

The CM changed all this dramatically.

Rich leaders

Essentially what the CM did was to divert the giving of the saints away from charity to giving to men and men's schemes (such as big buildings). No longer was giving at the direction of the individual conscience to the needs of the poor, but was directed automatically to the leadership of the church ('the storehouse') in monthly tithes. This was then mainly used for building purchase and maintenance, followed by salaries and expenses. For decades CM churches generated millions of pounds in annual turnover and gave nothing at all to the poor.⁶⁷ However, during that period the salary of top leaders rose exponentially.

This stopped individuals from being able to hear from God about what to give to since all their spare money was given to the church in a direct debit. Worse still this was usually donated via the gift-aid scheme so that the world contributed to the church's coffers. In the worst cases, donated money was used in fraudulent schemes and tax-avoidance measures to boost the pot.⁶⁸ Even the best cases (without fraud) were unbiblical since the poor were neglected and leaders enriched.

Example: Benny Hinn

On YouTube you can find exposés of this man's fabulous expenses. Whistle blowers have given access to receipts, invoices and financial details, including hotel room numbers and expense accounts. The extravagance of his lifestyle can only be described as princely (in

⁶⁶ Being paid for holding an office while serving in that capacity.

⁶⁷ Some are now giving a very small proportion to minor things. For example, eight years after its formal appearance I made a formal case to Terry Virgo's flagship church to begin programmes for the local poor. I even produced a dossier showing God's commands about this and laid out plans and even liaised with local social services. My efforts were praised to my face but absolutely nothing of any use was done.

⁶⁸ I have spoken to the ex-treasurer of a large CM church who confirmed many cases of fraud and tax-avoidance; but he would not go on written record. He put down the job partly for these reasons.

fact some of his hotel rooms are advertised as ‘fit for a prince’).⁶⁹ One whistle-blower explained that he left the ministry because there was no evidence of even one single miracle as being genuine. Yet providing miracles is the basis of his fund raising ministry. The whistle-blower stated that deception was used to fool people into giving money.

Hinn’s purpose-built home overlooks the Pacific Ocean and is worth ten million dollars. It boasts seven bedrooms, eight bathrooms, and over 7,000 sq. ft of living space. Hinn travels in a private jet that costs over 112,000 dollars a month to run. Two of his cars are Mercedes vehicles retailing at over \$80,000 each. Hinn’s hotel rooms are usually presidential suites or royal suites costing up to \$2,700 a night; in one case his London hotel was over £3,000 but in yet another case in Milan his room was \$10,800 per night.

Hinn spends a fortune in Hollywood fashion stores like Versace. Lay-overs on flights, such as in Cancun, cost \$2684 per night. Two of his meals cost over \$900, and £1725. Hinn spent \$6361 in incidental expenses in London alone in one day (e.g. chauffeur services). Hinn often tips people up to \$1,000 a time. In one month, in 2003, \$23,000 was given to Hinn in petty cash. \$25,000 was given for expenses in an Anaheim crusade. A babysitter once cost \$2550 for one night. His organisation turns over 100 million dollars a year.

Example: Kenneth Copeland

Hinn is not alone. Indeed, some of the Word Faith preachers have a bigger fortune than Hinn. Kenneth Copeland has fleets of limousines and Lear Jets. Just one jet cost \$20 million, which is housed in Copeland’s own airport. Despite promises on air that the aircraft would only be used for the ministry, it was used to fly Copeland’s family to vacations.

Copeland has been the subject of a Federal investigation since gifts to preachers are tax-free. The government was concerned that Copeland Ministries was diverting gifts to the ministry into for-profit companies, such as cattle, horses, aviation, oil wells and real estate. Whistle-blowers, who have left the ministry in disgust, have informed the federal departments that Copeland Ministry assets are being diverted for private use and investments.⁷⁰

The reason people give to this ministry is greed. Copeland tells them that they will receive a hundred-fold in return for every dollar they donate.

Others

However, folk in the UK are not quite so rich, but they are affluent. Leaders in key CM churches, especially those calling themselves apostles, have made a very good living for 50 years on CM teaching. They equate their job with a company CEO and get paid accordingly. [They used to equate their pastoral role with a teaching head of department, or a head teacher, but have now gone up in the world.] One CM leader used to live in the house owned by Clive of India (i.e. an aristocratic mansion).

CM leaders today can expect high salaries with all the perks of a senior executive (pension, expenses, medical care, new car every two years, etc.). Many of them were given their houses as a result of a gift day, or at least had a large proportion of it donated. Their house is usually situated in a posh part of town. Often, people feel it is a duty to God to support their leaders, and so do many tasks for them: cleaning, baby-sitting, gardening and so on. If they go on vacation, people will drive them to and from the airport.

⁶⁹ Source: *Dateline Sunday*, US NBC TV programme, available on YouTube.

⁷⁰ *CBS Evening News with Katie Couric* video, regarding Senator Charles Grassley’s investigation.

In general, most (not all) CM top leaders have a very luxurious, affluent lifestyle that befits the top echelons in society. However, it is often the case that the church members that they represent are often moderately off or poor; indeed many are students. Yet these low paid workers give their tithes so that the leaders can live a lifestyle several grades higher than themselves. I have known a top CM leader live in affluence while junior workers in his evangelistic teams were so poor that they could not afford soap or a house group leader in his church could not afford to feed his family properly.

All of this is not only a reversal of what should be happening, but it is worldliness, greed and sin. No early Christian church leader was rich; indeed both Jesus and the apostles preached against the rich. In the early church being poor was seen as a helpful discipline, now being rich is seen as being a Christian right.

Mistakes made

- Not living by faith.
- Asking directly for money; i.e. not asking generally to help relieve the poor but directly asking for people to give to you or your ministry.
- Asking indiscriminately for money; i.e. not just to the Lord's people but anyone listening.
- Defending a rich or affluent lifestyle, way above the means of your own church members.
- For some it is living extravagantly rich, like a prince, off the giving of the saints who are often poor.
- Ignoring the needs of the poor, weak and vulnerable who are the real objective of Christian giving.
- Misusing God's money.

All of this is a disgrace and it will merit God's judgment on the Last Day. The great sadness is that during the period of the CM history, the levels of poverty have increased, wages have been frozen, the middle-class has been squeezed, the young cannot afford homes, children are fainting from hunger at school and so on. Yet during this very period the amount of Christian giving to the poor was depleted and the money was redirected to rich church leaders. God is angry about this.

Giving in the CM churches is a complete failure.

The failure of CM leadership

Summary

We have identified the faults of Charismatic leadership in many papers and need not fully rehearse them here. What I want to demonstrate are actual cases of failure since there are so many of them. However, I will give a brief summary of the problems of Charismatic leadership.

- *Failure to feed the sheep.* Genuine Bible teaching and doctrinal training have been almost completely abandoned. Sermons are superficial, agenda driven propaganda or even worse. There is no catechising, no understanding of historical confessions. The vast majority of Charismatics do not even know what the proper Gospel is.
- *Failure to protect and shepherd the sheep.* Leaving people to become prey for predators. Leaving people victim of satanic oppression or worse, bringing in satanic forces under the guise of Christianity. Multitudes of people have been exposed to devilish doctrines and satanic practices.

- *Failure to strengthen the sheep.* A failure to bind the broken. There are numerous tragic stories of abused people in Charismatic churches; I have had to minister to many. People that previously had a normal life have been left broken and dejected by Charismatic ministry. In some cases there have been terrible abuse of all sorts: emotional, psychological, spiritual, physical, sexual.
- *Authoritarianism: Ruling with force and cruelty.* The model of leadership is demonic and worldly, being pyramidal, centred in one man's lordship. He may have various titles (pastor, apostle, prophet or archbishop) but his power is unbiblical since Biblical church leadership is only a team of local elders and no one else.
- *Leaders feeding themselves; looking after their own interests.* See for example the hordes of super-rich Charismatic leaders (see earlier) who have become fabulously wealthy on the back of poor followers.

Leaders abandoning their ministry

Large numbers of leaders have proved in their own lives that the CM promise was false. Over time they abandoned their Charismatic ministry and departed for non-Charismatic churches or even apostatised. These men are typical of large numbers of non-leaders who have also left the CM and gone back to Anglican or other churches; some staunch evangelicals have even transferred to Roman Catholic churches.

There has been testimony after testimony of leaders leaving a CM church, but most of these are not famous names; locally and even nationally we are familiar with many. However, I will mention two examples of more famous people showing how one apostatised and the other jumped ship.

Examples

- Michael Harper, key in the original Renewal Movement, abandoned evangelicalism to become an Eastern Orthodox priest in 1995.
- Roy Clements, significant leader, preacher and writer, abandoned the faith and his family in 1999 to live with a homosexual.

Cases like these are important since the Charismatic baptism in the Spirit is supposed to give power to live a new life and prevent this sort of thing from happening. Harper championed Charismania to change the formal institutional UK churches (chiefly Anglicans) to be more open, communal and free in the Spirit but left for the most rigidly formal, iconoclastic, ritualistic church in the world.

Clements' case means that his whole ministry was hypocritical for years; despite being lauded as a semi-Charismatic intellectual. Some years before his demise I heard him preach and it was very clever and academic but dry and spiritually dead. I could not understand the esteem other leaders gave this man. Now I know why.

Leaders forced out of ministry

Again there are large numbers of these, many involving locally well-known people, as well as internationally known men. I have long ceased to be surprised by the numbers of UK Charismatic leaders that have lost their ministry due to fornication, adultery, alcoholism or some other scandal.

Among these are the following:

- Paul Cain (internationally famous Latter Rain prophet): eventually forced to leave the ministry for a period after he confessed to being an alcoholic and a homosexual (see later).

- David Mansell (UK Restorationist prophet): forced to put down ministry for a time after a scandal.
- Todd Bentley (US Charismatic revivalist prophet): forced to cease ministry for a time after committing adultery.
- Jim Bakker (US TV evangelist preacher): lost ministry after a sex and financial scandal (see later).
- Lonnie Frisbee (US pioneering prophet who kick-started the Signs and Wonders Movement): forced out due to homosexual lifestyle (see later).

As to the question of whether these men should have been allowed to return to ministry is for another time.

Moral failure: scandals involving Charismatics / Pentecostals

This could easily be a very long list but I have just selected a few characters to make the point. Many books expose various CM scandals and false leaders and some have compiled long lists of corrupt Charismatic leaders. However, it is tedious and unpleasant to trawl through this and unhelpful to prolong this issue; yet mention must be made as it is significant. Hence a mere selection here.

Larry Lea

The American TV channel *ABC* showed the televangelist pleading for donations when his house burned to the ground leaving him virtually homeless having lost everything he and his family had. Then *Prime Time* cut to Lea's other home - a mansion filled with furniture and valuables. His ministry was crippled, resulting in up to \$800,000 debt. Lea assumed another pastorate and set up a new organisation to prosper again (*The Prayer Ministry*).⁷¹

Jimmy Swaggart

Swaggart was exposed for sexual scandals in 1988 and 1991. At its peak Swaggart's ministry produced \$150 million per year and reached eight US viewers a week, plus programs translated into 13 languages and aired in 145 countries. By 1991 his ministry was \$4.5 million in the red after a church minister released photos of Swaggart with a prostitute. But other crimes emerged: a state court ordered Swaggart's to pay more than \$1.4 million to Heritage Worldwide of Dallas for Bibles and other materials that were delivered and not paid for. A computer firm sued Swaggart for payment of more than \$80,000 in software and services. He became a national figure of scorn and yet continues to minister.

Jim Bakker

Bakker was convicted on fraud charges after stealing 116,000 followers of his PTL ministries out of \$158 million in the 1980s. He resigned in 1987 amid a sex and financial scandal. Bakker served five years in prison.

A. A. Allen

Allen was a very famous Pentecostal and revered by many Charismatics, whom Benny Hinn called a '*great man of God*'. Let's just list some of his failings.

- Allen claimed that he could command God to '*turn dollar bills into twenties*'.⁷² Note this: he commanded God!!! [*God said "Thou shall decree a thing, and it shall be established unto*

⁷¹ Source: Christian Research Institute.

⁷² A. A. Allen, 'The Secret to Scriptural Financial Success', A. A. Allen Publications, Miracle Valley, (1953).

thee ... " I believe I can command God to perform a miracle for you financially. When you do, God can turn dollar bills into twenties."]⁷³

- Allen urged his followers to pay for ‘*prayer cloths anointed with the miracle oil*’.⁷⁴
- Allen sold ‘Miracle tent shavings’ for personal miracles.⁷⁵
- Allen repeatedly claimed that he could raise people from the dead., despite multiple failures to do so.⁷⁶
- Allen claimed to give followers who gave him £100, ‘*a new anointing and a new power to ... bestow upon each of them power to get wealth*’.⁷⁷
- He was arrested for drunk driving during a Tennessee revival in 1955, the first of many alcohol-related experiences.⁷⁸ He was eventually forcefully resigned from the Assemblies of God when he jumped bail after being arrested for drunk driving.⁷⁹
- Claims of healings at his commune were rebutted by local doctors who had to deal with emergencies caused by people ceasing their medication.⁸⁰
- In 1970 Allen died from ‘*sclerosis of the liver*’.⁸¹ On 14 June 1970, radio listeners in the United States, the UK, and the Philippines heard a recorded message from A. A. Allen saying: ‘*This is Brother Allen in person. Numbers of friends of mine have been inquiring about reports they have heard concerning me that are not true. People as well as some preachers from pulpits are announcing that I am dead. Do I sound like a dead man? My friends, I am not even sick! Only a moment ago I made a reservation to fly into our current campaign. I'll see you there and make the devil a liar*’. At that very moment police were removing A. A. Allen's body from a room at the Jack Tar Hotel in San Francisco strewn with pills and empty liquor bottles.⁸² The man who had once said that ‘*the beer bottle and gin bucket*’ should have been on his family coat of arms was dead at 59 from what was said to be a heart attack but was in reality liver failure brought about by acute alcoholism.⁸³

Lonnie Frisbee

Most people have not heard of this important figure, which is why I wrote a biography of him.⁸⁴ He was the seminal catalyst for the initial dramatic expansion of both Calvary Chapel and The Vineyard church movements; two of the biggest in the world. He claims to have brought many thousands to Christ and started numerous churches. He was also present at the root of the Christian Rock music developments and folk-rock based worship. More importantly, he was the initial instigator for the Signs and Wonders Movement, being the person to lead John Wimber into ‘power encounters’. Additionally, he was a significant bridge between Classic Pentecostalism and the emerging CM. He brought the

⁷³ David Edwin Harrell, Jr., ‘All Things Are Possible: The Healing and Charismatic Revivals in Modern America’, Indiana University Press, Bloomington, (1975), p75.

⁷⁴ A. A. Allen, ‘Miracle Oil Flows at Camp Meeting’, *Miracle Magazine*, June 1967, p6-7.

⁷⁵ ‘New Revival Tent Dedicated in Philadelphia’, *Miracle Magazine*, September 1967, p15.

⁷⁶ Hank Hanegraaff, ‘Counterfeit Revival’, (1997) citing Michale Moriarity, ‘The New Charismatics’ Zondervan, (1992), p2 and David Edwin Harrell, Jr., ‘All Things Are Possible: The Healing and Charismatic Revivals in Modern America’, Indiana University Press, (1975), p199.

⁷⁷ Harrell, op. cit., p200.

⁷⁸ Moriarity, op. cit., p35.

⁷⁹ ‘New Revival Tent Dedicated in Philadelphia’, *Miracle Magazine*, September 1967.

⁸⁰ James Randi, ‘The Faith Healers’, (1989), p87.

⁸¹ Gary L. Ward, "Allen, Asa Alonzo", in J. Gordon Melton (ed.), ‘Religious Leaders of America’ Gale Research, (1991), p9.

⁸² Actually, Don Stewart removed all of the bottles and threw them away before calling the police.

⁸³ James Randi, ‘The Faith Healers’, (1989), p88.

⁸⁴ See ‘Lonnie Frisbee’ on my website.

Pentecostalism of Kathryn Kuhlman,⁸⁵ Aimee Semple McPherson and Oral Roberts into mainstream evangelicalism long before Word Faith churches. Indeed, he was the most adept figure in bringing the slain in the Spirit phenomenon into orthodox churches, being proficient in this in the late 1960s.

Yet even at the height of his powers this man had serious character flaws. He neglected and then lost his young and vulnerable wife. He was loose with his language. He centred on supposed power rather than truth. But above all he was a practising homosexual even at the zenith of his supposed power ministry and evangelism. It was said that he *'partied on Saturday night and preached on Sunday morning'*. In the end he was shunned and written out of the formal histories of both Calvary and Vineyard - which is why few have heard of him. He was just too embarrassing. After a decade in obscurity, he died of complications from AIDS in 1993.

Paul Cain

Cain was part of the original Latter Rain movement, following the teachings of William Branham, but went into obscurity for decades until he teamed up with John Wimber. His theology is a variant of Branhamism, but he did not deny the Trinity amongst Charismatics. Cain famously taught the 'New Breed' or 'Manchild Company' doctrine, which is simply his term for Branham's 'Manifest Sons of God theology' about believers becoming super-beings.⁸⁶ For a time Cain back-pedalled on his Latter Rain heresies but later taught them openly.⁸⁷ After separating from Wimber, Cain joined RT Kendall at Westminster Chapel for a time before his downfall.

- Cain considered Branham to be *'the greatest prophet in the 20th century'*. This was due not to Branham's doctrines but to his gifting in the word of knowledge.⁸⁸
- Cain taught that in the end time Restorationism, *'all the sick are gonna be healed, the dead are gonna be raised and nations are gonna turn to God in a day'*.⁸⁹
- Cain taught the most extreme triumphalism for the CM: *'No prophet or apostle who ever lived equalled the power of these individuals in this great army of the Lord in these last days. No one ever had it, not even Elijah or Peter or Paul, or anyone else enjoyed the power that is gong to rest on this great army'*.⁹⁰
- Cain proposed a new order of Christianity: *'God's ... going to radically change the expression ... of Christianity in our generation ... a new order of Christianity ... God is offering to this generation something He has never offered to any other generation'*.⁹¹
- Cain demanded that people do not check his doctrine (which is unbiblical): *'Don't you even stop to disagree. ... don't bother with it; when we get to heaven we'll check it out and you'll find out I'm right'*.⁹²

⁸⁵ Admittedly Kuhlman was not from a Pentecostal church background but her ecumenical healing ministry was pure Pentecostalism.

⁸⁶ Latter Rain theology developed just after the first Superman comic-strip was syndicated in newspapers. In the Manifest Sons of God doctrines it taught that believers would be able to fly, be invulnerable to bullets, not need to wash and would walk through walls on this earth.

⁸⁷ 'For quite a while I have been embarrassed to say anything about the latter rain ... So I ... haven't said much about it. But I don't care what they think any more ... I believe we are going to have the latter rain and I am looking forward to it.' Paul Cain, Toronto Airport Church, 28 May 1995.

⁸⁸ John Armstrong, 'Paul Cain' in Michael Horton [ed.] 'Power Religion', (1992), p67.

⁸⁹ Bob Jones and Paul Cain, 'Selections from the Kansas City Prophets', audiotape (tape: 155C).

⁹⁰ Bob Jones and Paul Cain. 'Selections from the Kansas City Prophets', audiotape (tape: 155C).

⁹¹ Paul Cain, 'You Can Become the Word!', Vineyard Prophetic Conference (1989).

⁹² Paul Cain, 'Prophetic Power and Passion Conference', Christ Chapel, Florence, Alabama, August, 1995.

- Eventually, Cain was exposed as a homosexual and an alcoholic, which he was practising while he was being lauded by modern Charismatics. Though he stopped ministry for a time, he was later rehabilitated.

The expression of heresy from Cain is so extreme and so ludicrous (such as his exposition of Joel's army) that it should make people laugh out loud. Instead, Charismatics worldwide, for many years, took him on board as a major prophet and made themselves fools. Some of us who condemned him at the beginning were severely castigated; yet no one has apologised to us.

Every church leader that supported Cain and invited him into their church ought to repent before God and confess their sins and stupidity to their churches.

Such Pentecostal / Charismatic scandals could be repeated ad infinitum, there are so many; this will suffice.

Shepherding failure: occasions of spiritual abuse

It is the nature of Charismatic theology and practice that makes people so susceptible to abuse in an authoritarian system where men are treated like special agents of God. If you think that your leader is called by God, and you want to serve God, your defences are down when that leader then starts abusing you.

I do not want to list case after case of this unpleasant subject and many books have covered this for us.⁹³ There have also been many exposes on British television revealing the abuse of men like Benny Hinn or Morris Cerullo as well as deliverance ministries such as Ellel Grange.

The CM tends to attract many young, impressionable, vulnerable people especially students⁹⁴ (like any cult) and these will be more easily dominated by strong-willed leaders. The fact that supposed Christians can then take advantage of such sheep is an absolute disgrace. All we need to say here is that there are literally hundreds of thousands of cases where people have been physically abused, sexually abused, psychologically abused, financially abused and emotionally abused. People have been raped (sometimes multiple times), have been fleeced of their money, have been preyed upon, have been robbed of their time and have been dominated in their families. Leadership decisions have often split families.

No other church movement (Charismatic / Pentecostal) has anything like this scale of abuse. In fact, even the worst cults can't compare to the sheer levels of abuse found in the CM.

Accusations of authoritarianism: The Fort Lauderdale Five

This group is significant because they fed the error of authoritarianism into other church movements, notably the UK Restoration Movement.

⁹³ See the books that specifically deal with the 'Shepherding Movement' (in the UK 'Restorationism'). Also see books more generally on the CM such as: *Christianity in Crisis & Counterfeit Revival* by Hank Hanegraaff; *Power Religion* by Don Carson and others; *Charismania* by Roland Howard; *The Agony of Deceit* by Mike Horton and others; *The Drift into Deception* by Agnes & John Lawless; *The Toronto Blessing* by Nader Mikhael; *Wimber the Gnostic* by John Goodwin; John Goodwin, *Testing The Fruit Of The Vineyards*; *The Confusing World of Benny Hinn* by Fisher and Goedelman; *The Tongues Movement*, GH Lang or *Vengeance is Ours* by Al Dager. *Charismania* and *The Drift into Deception* mostly centre on abuse.

⁹⁴ Which is why many CM churches target student towns.

This was the movement led by Bob Mumford, Charles Simpson, Derek Prince, Don Basham and Ern Baxter, with assistance from Juan Carlos Ortiz – ‘Christian Growth Ministries’ [CGM]. I do not need to expand much on this as it is so well known.

Taking their start from some wrong ideas promoted by Watchman Nee in his book *Spiritual Authority* this group, also termed ‘the Shepherding Movement’, initiated the absolute rule of church leaders over their flock, using terms like ‘delegated authority’ and ‘covenant commitment’. Huge emphasis was placed upon the need for total submission of disciples to mentors. In the worst cases leaders determined not only a person’s spiritual life but also his employment, marriage, home life, and personal life. So called apostles had authority over other church leaders; pastors had authority over lesser leaders; lower leaders had authority over members – in a pyramid hierarchy of control.

Everybody had to be submitted to some man, ‘your covering’. It was said in the 70s that, ‘*down through the ranks went the orders, up through the pyramid went the money (tithes)*’. The controversy around this movement was international and huge. In 1975 Pat Robertson banned CGM leaders and erased all tapes that included them, even calling their teaching ‘witchcraft’. Kathryn Kuhlman refused to appear with Mumford. The Full Gospel Business Men’s Fellowship declared them persona non grata. Church leaders lined up to condemn them. In England stories emerged of disciples being controlled to the level of a leader determining their home decoration; these were not all fabricated.

Multiple cases of abuse were put on record with lawsuits being common. Story after story emerged where individuals were treated in an appalling fashion. Disciples began to obey their shepherd rather than God. It became so serious that the Five disbanded and pursued individual ministries and eventually renounced the whole work. Yet this ridiculous situation prevailed world-wide for many years throughout the late 1970s and early 80s. Indeed, many large ‘apostolic’ CM churches still retain this basic system in principle.

This demonic pyramidal system is totally contrary to the simple Biblical church leadership system of small churches, meeting in homes, led by a team of equal elders.

Accusations of authoritarianism: CJ Mahaney

This is a more recent example of someone demonstrating authoritarianism within the CM years after the demise of the Shepherding Movt.

In recent years, CJ Mahaney, president of Sovereign Grace Ministries, came under fire for his authoritarian leadership, and several key churches left the group of about 100 churches. The crisis came to a head when many complaints were lodged about his leadership style and Mahaney took a long leave of absence in 2011 to consider this. He was later reinstated as leader of the denomination, which moved to Louisville from Maryland in 2012. But conflict in the group continued and several more churches split from Sovereign Grace. Previously, Mahaney’s earlier partner, Larry Tomczak, described his parting of ways from Sovereign Grace Ministries as, ‘*an unbelievable nightmare*’, during which his family ‘*were threatened in various ways if [they] did not co-operate with [PDI/SGM]*’⁹⁵... *A letter was circulated in an attempt to discredit me and to distort the events surrounding my departure*’.⁹⁶ SGM is now involved in a major lawsuit for abuse, though some leaders have supported Mahaney.

⁹⁵ PDI = People of Destiny Int.

⁹⁶ Larry Tomczak; *Reckless Abandon*, p15. Thirteen years later Mahaney reconciled with Tomczak [see: *A letter from Larry Tomczak on his reconciliation with C.J. Mahaney*; July 4, 2011].

[Comment: I met Mahaney in the 80s and he struck me as one of the better, more spiritual, more humble Charismatic leaders; he also later embraced Calvinism. What this shows is what can happen even to a good man when doctrine is misunderstood; especially errors about leadership authority. Mahaney has now admitted making many leadership mistakes.]

In actuality, this is just the thin end of the wedge. Most Charismatic leaders exercise an authoritarian style of leadership.

Doctrinal failure: multiple false prophets and teachers

Again a list of these would take an entire book; the CM is riddled with the worst sorts of heretics and charlatans. We can only look at a couple of examples.

William Branham

First we mention William Branham because he is both a Pentecostal hero and also a chief inspiration for modern CM prophets. His influence throughout modern Charismatic churches is immense and worrying. Many CM leaders (like Rick Joyner and Paul Cain) have called him the greatest ever prophet.⁹⁷

Branham initiated the healing revival, which erupted in the US after 1945 and continued into the late 50s. He taught that the current period was the last age of the church, that Jesus was returning to judge America, and he was the prophet sent to prepare the end. His visions for the church provided the foundation for the teaching of the Sharon Bible school, North Battleford, Canada, in 1947 which developed into the Latter Rain revival in 1948.

We can summarise Branham's current CM doctrines in this way:

- The gifts of the Holy Spirit could be transmitted through the laying on of hands by a man with those gifts.
- Revelation is given by angels, dreams, visions, and prophecy.
- The word of knowledge is prescience and enables healings.
- The prophet has authority over the church.

We can summarise his heresies like this:

- He denied the Trinity and taught it was a demonic doctrine believed only by people in the Babylonian (apostate) church. His idea of the Godhead was modalist (as in Oneness Pentecostals). Thus baptised believers needed to be rebaptised in the name of Jesus only.
- He believed occult numerology to be true.
- He believed that the Great Pyramid of Khufu was made by God and contained revelation equivalent to Scripture.
- He believed that the Zodiac equated to Scripture.
- He denied hell as eternal punishment.
- Eve had sex with the serpent, producing Cain as the 'Serpent's Seed' (thus a woman is the source of sin). The 'seed of God' or 'the Bride' or the 'New Breed' were Branham's followers.

⁹⁷ Sources include: Paul Fahy; *Charismatic Catastrophe*, and *The Rescue Package – Charismatic Background*. Stephen Sizer; *The Toronto Blessing*, (1990). William Branham, *Footprints on the Sands of Time: The autobiography of William Marrion Branham*, (Spoken Word Publications, 1975). William Branham; *The Original Sin*. Burgess and McGee, *Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements* (Zondervan). Andrew Strom; *The Enigma Of William Branham*. Al Dager; *Vengeance is Ours*, (Sword). A Pohl; *Why I left the Tongues Mvt*.

- Women were the lowest creatures in the whole earth who were ‘*not worth a good clean bullet*’.
- He testified that a certain man in India (one of his disciples) was ‘*the Son of God, Christ returned*’.⁹⁸
- He claimed that he was the seventh angelic messenger to the Laodicean Church Age.
- He claimed to be the angel of both Rev 3:14 and 10:7.
- He initiated the ‘Manifest Sons of God’ theology. This linked an immortal spiritual elite with a Corporate Christ (based on the Man-child of Rev 12) which will usher in the new age and rule the earth with a rod of iron. This corporate Christ will be perfect and empowered in the absolute fulness of the Spirit. Full redemption will mean the elimination of sickness and the reversing of the curse. There will be a purified elite group of overcomers (the man-child) who will manifest Christ and possess the Spirit without measure, who will purge earth of resistance. The leaders of the perfect church will judge the apostate Church. The church will reign over a purified earth where the glorious church has dethroned Satan, overcome secular evil and judged believers who failed to follow the vision. Some extremists went further and added that: the elite saints will be invulnerable to bullets and able to walk through walls or even fly. [Compare the Joel’s Vision teaching of Paul Cain and the ‘Dread Army’ of John Wimber.] They restore the earth and redeem creation according to Rm 8:22-23; and eventually overcome death itself. As a result, Christ does not need to return and the Church rules over the earth.

His CV

- He claimed that he was God’s voice to the church and identified himself with Elijah.
- Many of his prophecies failed to happen. For instance, he said that by 1977 all denominations would be included in the World Council of Churches under the control of Catholics; then the rapture would occur and the world destroyed.
- Some of his colleagues reported that his successful claims were fraudulent.
- His method of healing was exactly like spiritualism.
- He used clairvoyancy.
- He could only conduct healings with the presence of his ‘angel’, which was a demon. When Christians prayed against deception in his audiences, he was unable to minister.⁹⁹
- His claims to have raised the dead were denied as fraud by two former disciples.

This man is clearly an arch-heretic blasphemer, and yet he is the main Pentecostal source of modern radical CM teachings.

Prophecy failures

- Paul Cain declared that revival would break out in London in October 1990, timed with a Wimber conference in Docklands. Nothing happened. In fact the spiritual condition of the UK worsened significantly and numbers dropped over the decade.
- John Hinkle proclaimed on TBN that on 9 June 1994 God would ‘*rip all evil off the face of the earth*’. This was ‘verified’ by ‘*two men with reliable ministries*’. A defensive article supporting Hinkle was written by Karen Howe and printed in *Charisma* magazine in December 1994.

⁹⁸ Kurt Koch; *Occult ABC*, (1978) p66. Andrew Strom; *The Enigma Of William Branham*.

⁹⁹ Kurt Koch; *Occult ABC*, (1978) p235.

- Gerald Coates: ‘*Dr. Kendall - in 18 months from this month (April 1995) your church, Westminster Chapel, will be unrecognisable ... the Holy Spirit will increase in power (!). In 18 months (i.e. October 1996) the Spirit of God - not just upon Westminster Chapel, but upon Westminster itself, upon the high of the land, upon many who live in that area, is going to come on that place ... the Spirit of God is so strong in that place ...*’ Prophecy given at Spring Harvest, 20 April, 1995 and circulated by Kendall at Westminster Chapel in December 1995. Result: By the date specified, over 100 people left the church amidst much division and despondency. The church dwindled and had less impact on the surrounding area than ever before. If anything, the ‘high of the land’ in Parliament became more ungodly with reports of sleaze and deceit. (See Alan Howe, *Evangelicals Now*, Feb 1997). One former member stated that the church was ‘*a shell of its former glory*’. (Neil Richardson, *Vanguard* article and App 3 in *Beware the New Prophets*).
- In 1991 Gerald Coates visited New Zealand where he told church leaders that an earthquake would devastate Lake Taupo in April 1991. Local Elim pastors instigated a national media campaign to warn the nation. 44 Elim churches went on survival courses. Result: nothing happened except that the church became a national laughing stock. [Widely reported in the Christian press, see also Bill Randles, *Beware the New Prophets*, St Matthew Pub. Ltd, p118-119.]

The number of false prophecies in the CM is hilariously huge. False prophets just keep doing this. However, it is not just major false prophets but also many in the churches. I have heard an important ‘apostle’ utter several false prophecies, some of major import with bad consequences, but no one ever rebuked him and he never apologised. As in many cases, it was just quietly forgotten. This is a shoddy way to behave.¹⁰⁰

Further discussion of this topic would require a very large book; this will have to suffice.

There is no doubt that the CM has produced more leadership scandals, frauds, abuses, and crimes than any other historical church group apart from Roman Catholicism (which had a 1,500 year head start).

CM leadership is a complete failure; worse than that, it is a laughing stock!

The failure of CM doctrine

There is no space here to provide an encyclopaedia of Charismatic false doctrines; besides, I have done this several times in other places.¹⁰¹ What I want to do here is simply give some quotations that demonstrate heresy from Charismatic leaders’ own words and a summary. This is just a small sample of what could be adduced, so vast are the sheer numbers of heresies.¹⁰²

Denial of the authority of Scripture

It is no more the primary purpose of the church to teach the scriptures than it is for British Rail to promote timetables.¹⁰³

¹⁰⁰ God uses irony. In one case an apostle I had confronted (and I was subsequently slandered by his people, who had been friends) first said that God had decreed that a old cinema in Brighton would become the new church building to accommodate growth. It was purchased by a rival church group. Then he prophesied that a defunct supermarket in Hove would be the new church building. I purchased that property on behalf of Royal Mail for a new sorting office. These false prophecies were simply forgotten and ignored.

¹⁰¹ See for instance, *Nailing Charismatic Theology, Charismatic Catastrophe, The Rescue Package – Charismatic Theology*.

¹⁰² Most of these quotes are taken from my book, *Charismatic Catastrophe*.

¹⁰³ Gerald Coates; *Evangelicals Now*, July 1996, quoted in *Contending Earnestly For the Faith*, 4.2, p8.

The word will do you no good.¹⁰⁴

It's not a worthy goal just to be informed by the Bible... It's evil when you hide behind doctrinal beliefs.¹⁰⁵

Denial of eternal punishment

I have problems with hell being eternal punishment.¹⁰⁶

Denial of the Trinity; blasphemy of the Godhead

There are nine of them ... the Holy Spirit has a soul and a body separate from that of Jesus and the Father... God the Father ...walks in a spirit body and he has hair ... has eyes ... has a mouth ... has hands.¹⁰⁷

This is based upon Mormon doctrines.

Denial of God's sovereignty, glory and transcendence

Man was created on terms of equality with God, and he could stand in God's presence without any consciousness of inferiority.¹⁰⁸

Faith is a force just like electricity or gravity ... we are a class of gods.¹⁰⁹

The biggest failure in ... the whole Bible is God.¹¹⁰

Each time you stand on the word you are commanding God.¹¹¹

I am a little god! Critics, be gone.¹¹²

I'm Benny Jehovah.¹¹³ You are a little god on earth running around ... I am a little Messiah walking on earth.¹¹⁴

You're not looking at Morris Cerullo – you're looking at God. You're looking at Jesus.¹¹⁵

The presence of the Lord smells like a woman wearing too much perfume.¹¹⁶

¹⁰⁴ Paul Cain; speaking at the *School of Prophecy*, Anaheim, Nov 1989 session 7.

¹⁰⁵ John Wimber; John Goodwin, *Testing The Fruit Of The Vineyards*, St Matthew Pub. Ltd. p11, 13. Quoting from Wimber's: *Church Planting Seminar*, tapes 1,2,3,4,5, March 28, 1981 and others.

¹⁰⁶ Gerald Coates; *Evangelical Times*, Jan 93.

¹⁰⁷ Orlando Christian Center broadcast, Trinity Broadcasting Network; 13.10.90; quoted in *The Confusing World of Benny Hinn*, p6. Similar statements are quoted in *Christianity in Crisis*, p124.. Although he once repented of this error after receiving many condemnations in 1991, he later repeated it again. His repenting is serious in itself since he made the errors under the divine 'anointing' specifically claimed to be a revelation from God. He took up the errors again on TBN 3.10.91 and on TBN's *Praise The Lord Show*, 23.10.92.

¹⁰⁸ Kenneth Hagin; in Hank Hanegraaff, *Christianity in Crisis*, Harvest House Pub. (1993), p11 & *Berean Call*, June 1993.

¹⁰⁹ Kenneth Copeland; spoken on TBN TV programme with Paul Crouch. *Berean Call*, June 1993.

¹¹⁰ Kenneth Copeland; *Praise-a-thon* programme on TBN April 1988, quoted in *Christianity in Crisis*, p125.

¹¹¹ Kenneth Copeland, quoted in *Alpha – the unofficial guide*, p67.

¹¹² Paul Crouch, TBN *Praise The Lord* programme, 7.7.86.

¹¹³ Benny Hinn; *Spiritual Warfare Seminar*, Jubilee Christian Centre 2.5.90. Quoted in *The Confusing World of Benny Hinn*, Fisher and Goedelman, Personal Freedom Outreach, St Louis, (1996) p12.

¹¹⁴ Benny Hinn; Trinity Broadcast Network's (TBN) *Praise The Lord Show*, 6.12.90.

¹¹⁵ Morris Cerullo; in Hank Hanegraaff, *Christianity in Crisis*, Harvest House Pub. (1993), p11.

Denial of Biblical Christology

He who is the nature of God became the nature of Satan when he became sin. ... First he died spiritually and then he died physically...Jesus Christ knew the only way He would stop Satan is by becoming one in nature with him.¹¹⁷

Denial of the efficacy of Christ's atonement

Do not be surprised if there is weeping wailing and gnashing of teeth among the saved who stand before the Lord ... the blood of Jesus Christ will not cleanse [the rebellious Christian] from all sin ... such sins will stare him in the face at the judgment.¹¹⁸

'Satan conquered Jesus on the cross.'¹¹⁹

'Christ's physical death on the cross was not enough to save us.'¹²⁰ 'The cross is actually a place of defeat'.¹²¹

Denial of justification

Unbelievers are being converted just through going out under the power of the Spirit.¹²²

Denial of the Gospel

I didn't believe in God, but ... out of desperation ... I said, "Jesus, Jesus, Jesus." I just began to say that name, and a power came through my body.¹²³

If you want forgiveness of sins, if you want the blessing of God in your life - come and touch Jesus. ... You will feel him. ... it depends on you ... how determined are you?¹²⁴

Meritorious redemption

If you take time to tithe, and tithe correctly, it's impossible to go to hell ... Tithing will keep you in heaven; it will keep you in the presence of God.¹²⁵

This is no different from the despicable sale of papal indulgences,¹²⁶ which precipitated the Reformation in Germany. This denies the doctrines of grace. It is a cardinal error.

Denial of sanctification

'I want you to do stupid things,' thus says the lord.¹²⁷

¹¹⁶ Taped interview between Bob Jones and Mike Bickle. *The Shield* newsletter 1992 R. K. McGregor Wright, Th.M., Ph.D. <http://www.dtl.org/shield/latter-rain-1.htm>]

¹¹⁷ Benny Hinn; Compiled from Orlando Christian Center broadcast, Trinity Broadcasting Network; 9.12..90 and sermon late 1988 Quoted in *The Confusing World of Benny Hinn*, p7-8.

¹¹⁸ R.T. Kendall; *Once Saved Always Saved*; p125ff.

¹¹⁹ Kenneth Copeland; in Hank Hanegraaff, *Christianity in Crisis*, Harvest House Pub. (1993), p11.

¹²⁰ Kenneth Hagin; in E. McDonald, *Alpha – the unofficial guide*, p104.

¹²¹ Kenneth E Hagin, *The Believer's Authority*; Faith Library Pub, (1992), p16.

¹²² John Arnott, Leader of Toronto Airport Church; *Sword & Trowel*, 1997 - 1, p31.

¹²³ Steve Hill; Evangelist at Brownsville AOG Church, Pensacola. Interview on TV's 20/20, quoted in *The Berean Call*, May 1998.]

¹²⁴ David Hathaway; *Prophetic Vision*, Issue 37, p7.

¹²⁵ Creflo Dollar, *The tithing question*.

¹²⁶ Authoritative documents sealed by the pope that released dead people from purgatory for a price.

¹²⁷ Kim Clement Prophet; Renee Rodriguez; *Just Give Me The Facts*; www.AgeTwoAge.org

Do not think about what you are doing ... just give yourselves completely to the Spirit ... let yourselves go, don't even think about what you are doing ... release your mind, release your spirit, and let the mighty river of the Holy Ghost take you.¹²⁸

Triumphal Dominionism

Is it possible that there will be a people who so possess the authority of Almighty God, as Elijah did, that they, as a group, will say to death, hell, and the spirit of Satan, "We will NOT die. We will stay here and be changed, and we will call Jesus Christ to return to this earth as King of Kings and Lords of Lords"? Yes, that is what I believe the church must do! ... "all power is given unto me in heaven and in earth," and the church today has that same power. Death will not be conquered by Jesus returning to earth. It will be conquered when the church stands up boldly and says, "We have dominion over the earth".¹²⁹

[End time prophets] will be the generation that's raised to put death itself underneath their feet.¹³⁰

That's what the children are entering into: they'll have the Spirit without measure, they'll walk through walls; they'll be translated.... Incorruptible flesh will they have and the lightning in their hands will be the hiding place of their power.¹³¹

What is about to come upon the earth is not just a revival, or another awakening; it is a veritable revolution. The vision was given in order to begin to awaken those who are destined to radically change the course, and even the very definition of Christianity.¹³²

Triumphal spiritual warfare

Marching for Jesus is a prophetic act which demonstrates that the meek shall inherit the earth. Each footstep on the march is an action which claims the ground ... we are claiming it ... by shifting the spiritual powers that have been allocated in the nations.¹³³

The main reason for it's [MFJ]¹³⁴ existence is to engage participants in "spiritual warfare" ... the chief stated objective of the March For Jesus is to change the spiritual atmosphere of the marched areas by claiming victory over the demons/evil spirits in that area.¹³⁵

The structures of the satanic strongholds will be refurbished with a whole new personnel. I believe with all my heart that the rediscovery of territorial spirits is part of God's desire and design to get his people into the full knowledge of the sons of God so we can grow in stature geographically and territorially as well as powerfully that this will enable us to fulfil the world mission of the church. (That is for the world to be under Christian leadership.)¹³⁶

¹²⁸ Leader at a meeting in Brownsville Church, Pensacola. Quoted in Robert S Liichow, *The Two Roots of Today's Revival*, Truth Matters Pub. p153-4.

¹²⁹ Earl Paulk, *The Proper Function of the Church*, p13.

¹³⁰ Bob Jones, tape: *Visions & Revelations* (1988) quoted in Cloud, *The New prophets*, Way of Life Literature, Oak Harbour, Washington, p10.

¹³¹ Bob Jones; Ibid.

¹³² Rick Joyner, *The Harvest*, 'Joel's Army'.

¹³³ Gerald Coates; *March For Jesus*, p131.

¹³⁴ March For Jesus.

¹³⁵ Graham Kendrick; *March For Jesus: Why?*, CRN Magazine.

¹³⁶ Roger Forster, *Territorial Spirits*; Introduction.

Belief in the relics of saints

There is nothing theologically out of line with ... [being] healed as a result of touching the relics of saints.¹³⁷

Embracing the occult

Man still does not realise the spiritual power that [God has] given to him ... to rule his environment.¹³⁸

Did you know that your words were creative? They are either creative in a positive or negative way. They can produce life or death.¹³⁹

By the spoken word we create our universe ... you create the presence of Jesus with your mouth ...through visualisation and dreaming you can incubate your future and hatch the results.¹⁴⁰

[We are to be tuned] to the inner voice of faith, not the outer voice of human reasoning. ... We don't understand the Bible with our mind.¹⁴¹

Communicating your ways unto the Lord ... means, of course, to follow intuition, for intuition is the magic path, the beeline to your demonstration [bringing to pass what you want]. Intuition is a Spiritual faculty above the intellect.¹⁴²

There have been many big misunderstandings and divisions caused when only the written word, the Bible, is believed to be self-revelational.¹⁴³

Your mind possesses the power to move things without the assistance of your physical hands ... Your mind can start fires ... the mind is capable of bending spoons. [Telekinesis]¹⁴⁴

When people have deep ... experiences of God, ESP experiences often occur. Clairvoyance, telepathy, precognition, psychokinesis, and healing have been observed.¹⁴⁵

In your imagination allow your spiritual body, shining with light, to rise out of your physical body. Look back so that you can see yourself ... Imagine your spiritual self ... rising up through the clouds and into the stratosphere. Observe your physical body ... as you leave the earth. Go deeper and deeper into outer space ... Note carefully any instruction given.¹⁴⁶

¹³⁷ Goodwin, op. cit. p17.

¹³⁸ Paul (now David) Yonggi Cho, *The Fourth Dimension*, Vol 2; Bridge Pub. (1983); p38.

¹³⁹ Paul (now David) Yonggi Cho, *The Fourth Dimension*, Vol 2; Bridge Pub. (1983); p119.

¹⁴⁰ Paul (now David) Yonggi Cho; *Berean Call*, June 1993.

¹⁴¹ Kenneth E Hagin, *Faith Edition Bible*, plxxxiv; pxxxiv.

¹⁴² Florence Scovel Shinn, *The Power of the Spoken Word*, (Marina del Rey, DeVorss & Co. (1945); p10.

¹⁴³ Oral Roberts, *11 Major Prophecies*, p44-45; quoted in Curtis I Crenshaw, *Man as God; The Word of Faith Mvt.* Footstool Pub. (1994); p216.

¹⁴⁴ Prophet/Bishop Bernard Jordan, head of *Zoe; Countdown to Prophetic Congress Calendar*, 10, 12, 16 March 1998.

¹⁴⁵ Morton Kelsey, *The Christian and the Supernatural*, Augsburg (1976); p113. Kelsey says that Jesus' power was the same as that exhibited by shamans (p93), and that God works through shamans (*Dreams: A Way to Listen to God*, Paulist Press, 1978, p29). Kelsey was a key influence on Wimber. Students at Wimber's seminars were encouraged to read Kelsey.

¹⁴⁶ Richard Foster, *Celebration of Discipline*, Hodder & Stoughton (1982), p27.

Your thoughts can establish whatever form you desire ... Stop looking for power outside of yourself ... Your mind has unlimited power.¹⁴⁷

Religious experience is found by turning inward and using one's imagination as a tool with which to contact the reality of the spiritual world.¹⁴⁸

Ecumenism

The reformation quarrel with Roman Catholics is no longer relevant.¹⁴⁹

It is my hope that this proposed project will result in substantial reconciliation between the major monotheistic faiths.¹⁵⁰

Roman Catholics into the charismatic renewal ... are way ahead of many Protestants in this regard; we Protestants are learning much from them.¹⁵¹

The Catholic tradition tends to produce a few spiritual giants [by which he means the mystics], whereas the evangelical tradition produces a lot of spiritual babies.¹⁵²

The reason why I ... related to the Roman Catholics was because I saw that they had the same experience that I had, of the baptism of the Spirit ... the basis of fellowship is not primarily doctrine, it is those who God has drawn into his fellowship.¹⁵³

The Reformation was a mistake.¹⁵⁴

I wanted to observe a modern Charismatic Catholic Mass and it was the most reverent thing I have seen in the whole Conference. Quite astonishing. ... When you've got a Roman Catholic (who is) really accepting Jesus Christ as his saviour ... I want to put my arm round my brother and say look we are regiments in the same army.¹⁵⁵

A short list of Charismatic heresies

- Denial of the inspiration and authority of Scripture.
- Anti-Trinitarianism by some (e.g. Oneness Pentecostals and those who baptise in the name of Jesus only).
- Denial of the sovereignty of God, in salvation, history and the world.
- Denial of, or confusion about, justification.
- Heresies about the person and work of Christ.
- Arminian Gospel held by most (not all). The minority that claims to be Calvinistic is really Amyraldian. Some teach extreme Gospel heresies, such as meritorious redemption.

¹⁴⁷ Prophet/Bishop Bernard Jordan, head of Zoe; *Countdown to Prophetic Congress Calendar*, 27, 30 January, 3 March 1998.

¹⁴⁸ Morton Kelsey, *The Other Side of Silence: A Guide to Christian Meditation*, SPCK, (1977), p136.

¹⁴⁹ Gerald Coates; 'Coates in Westminster,' *Adullam Register*, pamphlet, July 1997.

¹⁵⁰ Lyn Green, Head of YWAM (UK); referring to the 'Reconciliation Walks around the Middle East engaging in 'identificational repentance to purge the sin of Christians during the Crusades. [*Contending Earnestly For the Faith*, 4.2, p9.]

¹⁵¹ Derek Prince; *Sword & Trowel*, 1997.2.

¹⁵² Charles Simpson; *Sword & Trowel*, 1997.2.

¹⁵³ Michael Harper; *The Brighton 91 Interviews*, WPU (Inc), Peacehaven (1991), p15.

¹⁵⁴ David Watson; *The Brighton 91 Interviews*, WPU (Inc), p15.

¹⁵⁵ Michael Green; *The Brighton 91 Interviews*, WPU (Inc), p19-21.

- Heresies about sanctification.
- Denial of hell as eternal punishment.
- Classic Pentecostals were Dispensational. Modern Charismatic Jewish Root and Messianic Churches are also Dispensational. Most other radical Charismatic churches are Dominionist, Triumphalist, Postmillennial.
- A Pentecostal doctrine of the baptism in the Spirit as a second blessing, mystical experience.
- Gibberish as the gift of tongues. Most would expect every baptised in the Spirit believer to have this gift.
- Belief in the demonisation of Christians.
- Acceptance of tithes as 10% of income; usually given to church leaders. [The tithe is not New Covenant and giving, which should be as God directs, is mostly to the poor and needy.]
- Completely false idea of what church is and what comprises church leadership.
- Confusion about healing. Many believe in an automatic healing in the atonement.
- Inner healing; healing of memories and associated doctrines.
- Common grace.¹⁵⁶
- Ecumenism.
- Idolatry.
- Little god theology.
- Heretical spiritual warfare doctrine.
- Latter Rain heresies.
- Sacramentalism.
- Occultism: spiritualism, magic, divination, fetishism, belief in ghosts and dryads etc.
- Paganism: Kundalini yoga, eastern mysticism etc.

This is just a quick summary off the top of my head; the list could be prolonged. Not all Charismatics believe all of these heresies, but they all appear frequently in Charismatic teaching.

We do not need to discuss this further; the quotes are surely shocking on their own. The CM is a true pit of every type of heresy known to man.

Excursus: the mind

One of the great sins of the CM is the centring upon the feelings and what are supposed to be spiritual things (but is really mysticism) instead of an intellectual pursuit of Biblical study. In fact, the Bible constantly appeals to believers to study God's word (Deut 17:19; Josh 1:8; Ps 1:2, 119:11, 97; Prov 6:23; Isa 8:20; Col 3:16; 2 Tim 3:14-17; 2 Pt 1:19) and be renewed in the mind (Rm 12:2) so that they are able to discern error and choose what is good (Lk 12:57). The ability to test everything (a command of God, 1 Thess 5:21) first requires knowledge and understanding. Thus the apostolic commission included an impartation, not of mystical power, but of understanding (Col 1:9-10). At the end of the day, the believer needs to know (i.e. use his mind to understand) what the will of God is (Eph 5:10, 17).

¹⁵⁶ Actually, this is widely accepted by evangelicals but it is modern and unbiblical. Grace comes from the cross and is only given to the elect that are regenerated in time. God does not favour or bless those who have no grace because they are not elect.

The failure of CM eschatology

Analysis

While there are common underlying themes, the eschatology of the CM in general is convoluted. There is a useful analysis of the eschatology of the New Church movement (Restorationism, which became the bedrock of the modern CM) which is worth reading if you want an analysis of all the forms up to 1997; though I disagree here and there.¹⁵⁷ To this the recent Jewish Roots / Messianic Church Movements must be added, which are a minor arm of the UK CM.

Although there are Dispensationalists,¹⁵⁸ Historic Premillennialists,¹⁵⁹ Amillennialists¹⁶⁰ and Postmillennialists¹⁶¹ in the CM,¹⁶² there is a great deal of confusion and contradiction on the ground, however, the key themes still stand out.

This is my simplified summary of the historic situation based upon experience.

- Those that identified themselves as Calvinists (though they were really Amyraldians) would usually be Amillennial; for example Terry Virgo's NFI [i.e. part of Andrew Walker's R1 group¹⁶³]. However, in reality they would have Premillennialists and Dispensationalists within their congregations. Yet the thrust of their vision, strategy and prophecies would be basically Postmillennial, Dominionist and Triumphal.
- The Restorationists outside NFI, formerly Harvestime then Covenant Ministries, under the late Bryn Jones (the remaining part of R1), would have originally been Dispensational, comprising Pentecostals and Brethren in the main. However, these drifted more and more into Triumphalist Postmillennialism, which was the basis of Restoration magazine and their eventual formal position. They even recommended 'The Puritan Hope'¹⁶⁴ to their leaders.
- Those that identified themselves as Arminian or worse (such as Open Theism) would identify themselves with Historic Premillennialism, mostly fundamentally influenced by GE Ladd (who emphasised the principle of 'now but not yet fully' of the kingdom). This would be, in general terms, the basis of the 'New Churches' associated with Gerald Coates and John Noble amongst others [i.e. Andrew Walker's R2 group], plus Ichthus later, all of which were heavily influenced by Roger Forster in this matter. Yet in their vision, strategy and prophecies they also were Dominionist and Triumphalist.

¹⁵⁷ James Martin Scott; 'The theology of the so-called 'New Church' Movement: an analysis of the eschatology (a thesis submitted for the degree of Master of Theology)', Brunel University, supervised by London Bible College, January 1997 (94pp). One example of my disagreement is that he overstates the influence of GH Lang. While Lang definitely influenced my late friend David Lillie, I doubt that many other CM leaders had even read him, perhaps excepting Arthur Wallis and David Matthew.

¹⁵⁸ A form of Premillennialism that began after 1830, heavily influenced by the writings of two Jesuits (Ribera and Lacunza) and a heretical church in London before Darby took it up. Its chief doctrine is the separation of Israel from the church in God's purposes. There are now multiple forms of Dispensationalism.

¹⁵⁹ Those who teach that Christ will return before the millennium. Held by a minority in the early church and very few during church history. It revived in the 20th century. It is more conservative than Dispensationalism.

¹⁶⁰ Those who deny a millennium (golden age) exists at all; non-millennialism. This was the traditional position of Reformed churches.

¹⁶¹ Those who teach that Christ will return after a golden age millennium. A minority of Puritans believed this.

¹⁶² Some people call themselves 'Futurists' regarding eschatology but this is misapplied. Futurism is a method of interpreting Revelation but it is not a category of eschatology. Futurists tend to be Dispensationalists.

¹⁶³ See Walker, 'Restoring the Kingdom', Hodder and Stoughton (1985).

¹⁶⁴ Banner of Truth. An analysis of Puritan Postmillennialism.

- The various smaller independent CM works would fit somewhere in these three forms and would mostly be Triumphal.¹⁶⁵
- The more recent Jewish Root / Messianic Christianity arm of the CM is Dispensational and largely opposed to Triumphalism and Dominionism.
- Classic Pentecostal churches would tend to be Dispensational.
- The influence of Latter Rain, which deeply impacted the CM, was originally Dispensational Premillennial, as an outgrowth of Pentecostalism. However, its teaching on the victory of the church at the end before a millennium was essentially Postmillennial in character. Traditional Pentecostalism taught that things will get worse while Latter Rain taught that things will get better (i.e. symbolised by the blessing of the Biblical annual 'latter rain' in Palestine). In fact, Latter Rain taught an extreme and radical form of triumphalism.

Thus the vision of most of the CM is Dominionist, Triumphalist and mainly Postmillennial with the exception of the Jewish Root Movement and Classic Pentecostals. However, in detail there is a lot of movement, confusion and differing opinions on the ground.

Expression

The outworking of this predominant Triumphalism is seen in many forms, such as claims of a coming global revival that will enable the church to rule the world; or claims that apostles will rule the earth. It is seen in the claims of Restoration magazine, which appropriated promises regarding the world after the Coming of Christ, and falsely applied them to the time before Christ returns. The whole ethos of the triumph of the church, evidenced in sermons, books, magazines and choruses follows this Dominionist eschatological line.

This triumph at the end was tied in with their theology of the victorious church. They taught that the Restored church, with apostles, prophets and spiritual gifts, would gain more and more influence in the world until the church oversaw a utopia. Frequently, apostles would work up their congregations with talk about 'taking their hometown' or 'taking their nation', while many choruses put this notion into song. The subject of victory (or 'kingdom now') used to dominate almost everything apostolic teams taught.

So the CM eschatology was tied in to the victory of the church in the world and the future global revival whereby the church would dominate mankind (essentially Latter Rain doctrines).

[We should note that the Biblical position is that the church suffers persecution at the end (Matt 24:9) so that finally the Antichristian government thinks that it has eradicated Christianity from the earth (Rev 11:1-10). There is a great falling away in the church during this time, not growing victory (2 Thess 2:3).]

Result

The reality is that the more that the CM has dominated the evangelical church, the opposite of this vision is what has come to pass. We have already discussed this failure of vision in this paper.

¹⁶⁵ Thus Barney Coombs' work at Basingstoke fits into R1 according to Walker; not by formal relationship but by style. He even had Rousas Rushdoony [the founder of Reconstructionism; an extreme form of Postmillennialism including Theonomy] speak at one leaders' conference. The work at Southampton, formerly under Tony Morton, was formally R1. The work at Bristol, originally pioneered by Peter Lyne, but later led by David Day, would fit into R2. Ichthus would be R2.

On the basis that we are much closer to the end today, the eschatology of the CM, in terms of its Triumphalism and Dominionism has been an utter failure. Society has worsened. The threat of World War III is looming. The biggest global economic collapse in history is predicted to occur soon. Muslims are set to equal Christians in the world's religious population; and so on. Paganism is the fastest growing UK religion. The church is in decline. The failure of the CM eschatology could not be greater. It was all a pipe dream.

This is a failure of millennialism. Indeed, it has to fail because millennialism (of any sort) has no Biblical basis. The Bible does not teach a future millennium, give any theology about it, or promise it. The only Biblical mention of a special 'thousand years' is in the highly symbolic book of Revelation where it refers to the period between the first and second coming of Christ; the Gospel Age; the Last Days. Millennialist fervour has always been a historic feature of authoritarian cults, sects and scandalous religious enthusiasm, indeed they often featured apostles and prophets; they all ended in failure.¹⁶⁶

The failure of CM practices

Again a book would be required to evaluate this properly. We cannot deeply investigate it here, and I have examined this in a number of papers. However, I want to simply enumerate some examples of what goes on in CM churches to illustrate the sheer insanity that pretends to be godly behaviour.

Fleshly spiritual warfare

Marching round the room

This is a practice derived from aberrant groups like the Shakers, a false Christian sect that adopted clear occult practices (such as spiritualism and divination) and whose leader (a woman called Anne Lee) claimed to be Christ. Needless to say that there is not a shred of Biblical foundation for such nonsense. The practice is claimed to have power to defeat devilish opposition.

Shouting at the devil

On numerous occasions a congregation has been told to scream, and shout to defeat local demons. At one Downs Bible Week under Terry Virgo in the 1980s, the unified shouting of several thousand people worried local people around Plumpton racecourse.

Waving banners and flags

This is supposed to initiate several things as a result of proclaiming the sovereignty of God, whose attributes are pictured in various designs. This corporate affirmation of God's authority is supposed to frighten away demons. One para-church group that makes much of flags is the Modern Jesus Army.¹⁶⁷

Knighting disciples

This unbelievable foolish practice emerged after several movies about medieval subjects appeared (it is interesting how often the CM copies secular events).¹⁶⁸ One church leader

¹⁶⁶ Most notably the tragedy of Munster during the Reformation. See my 'The Origins of Pentecostalism' for several examples.

¹⁶⁷ See 'Jesus Life 2K, No.50, 1999, 4th Qtr., p3.

¹⁶⁸ For example: the Holiness and Pentecostal movements arose around the time of the massive secular interest in spiritism and the occult. Prophets and the word of knowledge began to appear at the same time as secular clairvoyants and faith healers. Latter Rain, which taught that Spirit-filled believers would become virtual supermen, being invulnerable to bullets and able to fly, arose at the same time as the national syndication of the new Superman comic strip. The Charismatic knighting fad followed the big success of the film 'Braveheart'. The need for Christian counsellors followed the widespread acceptance of psychotherapy;

took a copy of the broadsword used by Mel Gibson in 'Braveheart' to knight his disciples to be able to fight the devil more effectively and wield authority.

Territorial spirits warfare

This false notion led to a whole raft of Charismatic doctrines and practices that would require a whole book to refute.

Essentially, this taught that local demons rule over villages and towns; more authoritative demons ruled over cities and regions, while arch-demons ruled over countries. The right ministry was needed to deal with each one; thus big demons needed apostles and prophets, or whole churches, to confront them (the 'Strategic Level Spiritual Warfare' of C. Peter Wagner.). This is a pagan notion.

This led to 'church mapping', whereby people with a supposed word of knowledge identified the demons in an area; then the church or a dedicated cell group was focused upon that particularly demon and tried to defeat it.

Some missionaries got involved in this and averred that it was only when local territorial demons (idols) were confronted that the Gospel had success (such as in Bhutan).

The problem with all this is that there is not a shred of Biblical evidence for it. Paul never confronted demons before preaching the Gospel and never taught us to.

Interestingly, great missionaries (such as JO Fraser of Lisuland) never paid any attention whatsoever, to local idols and demons¹⁶⁹ and had better success than modern missionaries in the same area.

Since the invention of territorial spirits, it is clear that evangelistic activity in Britain is much less successful than it used to be before the CM as the number of Christian converts decline.

Rain dance

One Charismatic church in Wales actually did a rain dance in the streets in order to end a period of drought, copied from a Native American Indian example. This was considered to be some sort of spiritual warfare. It didn't work. It didn't work because it was sheer paganism.

Deliverance ministry

Thousands of poor young believers have been subject to deliverance ministry to rid themselves of sin or fears. This is where a demon is supposed to be the root cause (say of rejection or lust) and then that demon is expelled in Pentecostal fashion. People with many psychological problems are subjected to multiple deliverance sessions, where dozens of demons of this or that are expelled, sometimes over many weeks.

There is not a shred of Biblical evidence to support this practice. No Christian was ever told by an apostle that he needed deliverance; indeed the apostolic Gospel was that Christians

they were not needed before. The common mystical phenomena in Charismatic churches followed the development of hypnotism (Mesmerism) where similar phenomena occurred (e.g. falling over or dancing on the spot). The action of Gerald Coates' teams to try to get the City of Westminster to remove pointed street signs, because they aided demonic activity, followed the fashion for Feng Shui.

169 Fraser often slept in a peasant's hut, which was strewn with idols the peasant worshipped. He never paid any attention to it because it was a lump of wood or metal (Isa 37:19, 'they were not gods, but the work of men's hands -- wood and stone').

had already been delivered. No one in the NT had a deliverance ministry and progressive sanctification came, not by exorcisms, but by edification, teaching, and spiritual maturity.

The idea that Christ in the heart of the believer would share his abode with a demon is unthinkable. Finally, deliverance ministry denies multiple texts; such as:

He has delivered us from the power of darkness and conveyed *us* into the kingdom of the Son of His love. Col 1:13

You, brethren, are not in darkness ... You are all sons of light and sons of the day. We are not of the night nor of darkness. 1 Thess 5:4-5

You *are* a chosen generation, a royal priesthood, a holy nation, His own special people, that you may proclaim the praises of Him who called you out of darkness into His marvellous light. 1 Pt 2:9

You have an anointing from the Holy One, 1 Jn 2:20

Sacramentalism

There are various forms of this in all sorts of churches. Sacramentalism is where physical objects are given spiritual power, or power to achieve spiritual success; it is common in traditional Roman Catholicism (such as using holy water).

Gemstones

There was a phase when Christian healing by faith was supposed to be aided by using gemstones, exactly in the manner of New Age cultists.

Anglican minister Tony Higton, [former associate of Clifford Hill and PWM] set up crystals in his church to empower people praying for healing as a symbolic aid to faith. Higton's changed behaviour, and U-turn on homosexual issues, began after being 'slain in the Spirit' at a Toronto meeting.¹⁷⁰

Candles

Various church leaders have used candles as a focus for spiritual direction in worship services.¹⁷¹

Stones

Norman Stanton [leader of the Jesus Army] got all the participants, during the 'Winning Festival Weekend', to wash a stone and place them in a pile at the front of the platform to signify a commitment to a changed and washed life.¹⁷²

Blowing ram's horns (shofar)

There was a time when Messianic Churches blew ram's horns on hillsides to promote revival. For example, this occurred in a now defunct Hove Messianic congregation [Shema Yisrael Messianic Synagogue], once led by a now-scandalised leader [Phil Sharp] which sought revival in Brighton and ceremonially blew a ram's horn and waved flags on the South Downs to 'open heaven'. Brighton is now a much worse place. The people who followed this leader were spread to the four winds with a few years.

¹⁷⁰ Reported in the Daily Telegraph, 6.7.98. Higton denied crystal-gazing but admitted learning from occult based New Age ideas. New Christian Herald, 25.7.98; Church of England Newspaper, 17.7.98.

¹⁷¹ As seen on Channel 4's, *God in the House* series.

¹⁷² Jesus Life, No. 46, (1998).

Crosses

The Jesus Army distributed wooden crosses, painted fluorescent red, and made in its workshop. These were then prayed over, given plaited strings and given to people on the street. People reported that the cross became a symbol of hope and love to them.¹⁷³

Bread (not part of the Lord's Supper)

The pastor of Rock Church, Baltimore, felt God direct him to bring a loaf of bread to the evening service which he broke up and gave to the congregation. Mystical blessings were then reported: healings, backsliders returning, people slain in the Spirit etc. Bits of bread were taken as far as Japan. As a result, Rock Church bakes several loaves each week for revival services.¹⁷⁴

Pendants and medallions

Some groups use various jewellery items as a means of grace. The Jesus Army encouraged followers to wear a nail at the Wembley Praise-Day in 1999. Those present were invited to take a four-inch nail attached to a piece of string and wear it for the day. This was supposed to dramatically symbolise commitment and sacrificial worship.¹⁷⁵

Pouring oil on rivers and smashing bricks

Seven Assemblies of God pastors poured oil on a river in order to bring the Gospel to the local town. They smashed bricks with a sledge hammer while an evangelist threw a bottle of oil into a river as an expression of 'prophetic symbolism' in order to encourage an outpouring of the Holy Spirit in Australia.¹⁷⁶

Miracle saw-dust

AA Allen distributed 'miracle saw-dust' from the floor of his 'miracle valley' tent.¹⁷⁷

Healing statues

Benny Hinn planned to set up a healing centre in Dallas which would have '*Healing Statues of Biblical saints from the Old Testament. It's going to have a Healing Fountain an Eternal Healing Fire*'.¹⁷⁸

Prayer sticks

During the period of interest in Celtic spirituality in the 90s, church leaders in Gerald Coates' stream began using decorated sticks as an aid to prayer. One leader in the affiliated Chichester church was seen in a documentary¹⁷⁹ dancing like a Native American Indian witch-doctor, waving a staff decorated with colours and feathers, in a time of church worship.

There are so many more examples: boulders placed in heaps to aid repentance; notes of sins a pieces of paper, burned to aid forgiveness and so on. In the Brownsville Pensacola church on one occasion a leader dressed as an OT high priest and had a replica of the altar of incense, to which international leaders came to pray. You cannot make these things up!!!

¹⁷³ Jesus Life 2K #50, 1999 4th Qtr, p24.

¹⁷⁴ Article 'Hungry for the Living Bread, by Adrienne S, Gaines, Charisma Magazine, Feb 1999.

¹⁷⁵ Jesus Life 2K #50, 1999 4th Qtr, p3 and p9.

¹⁷⁶ Vanguard, Issue 10, May 1999, p9.

¹⁷⁷ Contending Earnestly For the Faith Journal, 5.2, p21.

¹⁷⁸ Benny Hinn, from a Video screened on This is Your Day, 24 August, 1999; quoted from Contending Earnestly For the Faith Journal, 5.2, p21.

¹⁷⁹ 'God in the house'.

Fraudulent phenomena

There have been huge numbers of this if you count fraudulent healing; but leaving healing aside for the moment:

Gold dust

During the Toronto madness people were supposed to have had a covering of a gold sheen on their skin. Why this should be a spiritual benefit is beyond me. There was not one accredited example proved to be true.

Gold fillings

Similarly, also in the Toronto experience, some people claimed to have had their amalgam tooth fillings replaced with gold. Again there was not one proven example of this ever supplied.

Chaotic shouted prayers

This practice, which has historic origins in the Shouters¹⁸⁰ and Ranters,¹⁸¹ but was more recently developed in Yonggi Cho's church in South Korea, was imported through Charismatic apostles visiting Seoul and brought back to the UK, where it became the fashion for a time in the late 80s early 90s. It was considered more powerful if the whole congregation shouted their prayers all at the same time to create bedlam. Seeing this, one can honestly say it seemed as if the whole congregation went mad for a time. It greatly dishonoured the cause of Christ. It denies Paul's statement about the need to understand a brother's prayer to be able to say 'Amen' to it (1 Cor 14:16).

Like many other CM practices, this is a rejection of the command to,
Let all things be done decently and in order. 1 Cor 14:40

Being slain in the Spirit

This is an ancient pagan and occult phenomenon that arises from the suggestibility, passivity and hypnotism of a subject so that he goes into a trance and collapses. In extreme cases it results from the entrance of a demon into a submissive person; this is common in the Hindu transference of power by gurus.

Foolishly, several Charismatic authors have tried to make a formal case that an altered state of consciousness is a good and necessary part of the Christian experience. In fact it is not and the practice is entirely unscriptural. Nowhere in the Bible is someone given grace and ministered too by first making them fall over backwards. Occasionally a person fell forwards in a responsive act of submission and worship, but not backwards to get grace.

Various groups, usually heathen primitive tribes and animists, have used this technique in history but the practice multiplied in the west after the work of Anton Mesmer, who developed hypnotism. It occurred frequently in American frontier revivals (along with many other evils) and parts of the Holiness Movement. From there it became a key feature of early Pentecostalism, and thence became commonplace whenever there was a build up of audience emotionalism and expectation (such as in healing crusades).

There is no doctrinal basis to suggest that falling down backwards is a work of God or a preamble to obtain some sort of ministry or healing. Hundreds of medical examinations of

¹⁸⁰ An extreme faction of the Chinese church around the time of Watchman Nee. Some of his followers practised this.

¹⁸¹ Ranters: an antinomian, 18th century British cult.

people claimed to be healed when they fell down at a rally have shown that there was no organic change whatsoever; not even in Kathryn Kuhlman's meetings.

The failure

One simple, pragmatic thing to note is that such stupid and false aberrations often have their season. For a time, sometimes only weeks, sometimes a few years, such things are flavour of the month and then they die out and disappear. Eventually the fallacy of the practice becomes clear and it dwindles away.

For example, for several years Celtic spirituality was the very height of church fashion. There were multiple books, journals, gifts, decorations, music CDs, seminars, sermons, conferences and so on devoted to the subject. Today, no one ever mentions it.¹⁸²

The question one has to ask is: 'if such things are of God, then why did they die out?'. If something is true then it should be true forever. The fact that these things disappear simply reveals that they were satanic deceptions and false.

This leads to another question: 'if these practices were false, then where are the apologies and repentance from leaders?' CM leaders need to get on their knees and repent before God and apologise to their churches for bringing in these aberrations.

The failure of CM counselling

The essence of CM pastoral counselling is man-centred. It concentrates counselling upon the need to submit to this or that person.

In history, much Christian counselling arose in normal, everyday church life. Counselling occurred during catechising and teaching (which was didactic instruction) so that people learned how to counsel themselves. In church fellowship, counselling occurred in a normal social way as people edified one another and exhorted one another to love and good works. Since people were taught Biblical doctrines they had strength and knowledge to deal with most of their own problems. Thus one does not find counselling ministries appearing in the historic church. If there was a serious problem, then an elder dealt with the matter on a Biblical basis at the home of the patient.

All of this has changed dramatically.

No life

One of the key problems in CM churches is that, due to the poverty of Gospel preaching, many church members are not really Christians. Having been 'converted' in a purely emotional manner, usually in some big evangelistic meeting, they were declared to be saved and joined the church.

The consequence of this is that such people have masses of problems because they are not really saved. Therefore, there is a constant drain on the church due to hordes of counselling issues. In fact, many patients require counselling again and again. Most problems arise from sin, and if sin has not been propitiated because the conversion is unsound, then multiple issues, based on sin and guilt, will arise over and over again.

In my view, in some CM churches the majority of members are probably not converted at all; hence the massive drain on counsellors. This also shows the uselessness of the

¹⁸² See my 'Modern Celtic Spirituality'.

counsellors because they have not discerned that the real cause of the many problems is no spiritual life. What a mess!

No doctrine

Doctrinal teaching has fallen on hard times. Gone are the days when young converts would be thoroughly educated in Christian doctrines by being catechised in their homes. This is too much like hard work for modern CM leaders who ignore catechising altogether, under various cop-outs (such as, 'It is divisive').¹⁸³ When people fail to learn Christian doctrine, they soon become victims of all sorts of errors and it is these that lead to counselling crises. The people in CM churches are the weakest and most gullible believers in all history.

No fear of God

Because the love of God is championed as being the divine attribute par excellence (it is not), a wishy-washy vision of God is presented to the people. This leads to terrible nonchalance and frivolity in dealing with God. The Lord himself is often spoken off in terms of demeaning friendship (e.g. 'my man', 'my pal', 'my mocka', 'my bro', 'my home boy' etc.).

What happens then is that this buddyness with God, this superficial fellowship, is used as the basis of counselling instead of doctrinal application. God's love is the overriding factor, excluding all God's other attributes, including his wisdom, justice, discipline and holiness. 'God loves you and therefore cannot be against you', is the cry; ignoring that God may be chastising the person for sin. Antinomian doctrines also encourage this by teaching that Christians are never guilty before God.

Examples of a lack of godly fear

Charismatics, in many practices and behaviours, demonstrate that they have no fear of God; indeed many of their practices are blasphemous (such as the Toronto Blessing phenomena). When Benny Hinn blows the 'Spirit' to knock people over, that is a blasphemous action. He should consider that sinning against the Spirit has no redemption (Matt 12:31). When Kenneth Copeland converses in tongues with Rodney Howard Browne and laughing, it is a blasphemous action.¹⁸⁴ The way that many televangelists speak and behave on TV (making promises on behalf of God, speaking frivolously, lying, misusing Scripture etc.) is blasphemous action. When Todd Bentley punches a man so hard that his teeth come out on stage in the name of Christ, it is a blasphemous action. When Benny Hinn announces that a certain person is healed by God, but they die days later; he is a blasphemer. When leaders manipulate passive audiences, claiming that it is the Lord doing it but in reality it is hypnotism, they are blaspheming.

Where there is no fear of God, there is no life, no wisdom, no grace, no Spirit, no Christianity. Any counselling based upon this lack of the fear of God will be damaging in the long run.

False counselling methods

This is a huge subject that requires a separate book. Again, we can just skim the surface.

Due to a failure to be trained by scripture and good theology under godly pastors, many modern Charismatics are struggling with personal problems and getting no answers. As a

¹⁸³ Catechising is no more divisive than any other teaching. All church leaders teach some form of theology, even if it is bad theology. This theology is then in direct opposition to other theologies. No one can avoid division. What is important is to be separated from false teaching and learn the truth.

¹⁸⁴ Historic Biblical tongues were only used to proclaim the wonders of God; they are only ever directed to God and are known (but unlearned) languages.

result, a whole industry of counselling techniques, methodology, retreats, seminars, books and leaders has arisen in the last thirty years.

Deliverance ministries

We cover this in a different section of this paper.

Only God knows the number of people terribly abused and damaged by this sort of ministry. Apart from the psychological, physical, emotional and sexual abuses that have come to light, thousands of people have been spiritually damaged and left depressed.¹⁸⁵

Psychoheresy

Many counsellors don't just ignore the fear of God and the word of God negatively, positively, they utilise the tools of worldly psychology and psychiatry developed by such people as Freud, Jung, Rogers and Adler; but the root of all psychoanalysis was the occult mesmerism, trances and hypnosis of Franz Anton Mesmer. The tools were developed by men who are proven liars, frauds and occultists. Jung was dominated by the occult while Freud was influenced by mesmerism and is a proven fraud (he faked his experiments).

It is also clear that psychiatry does not work in the world, many studies have proved this. Over 250 therapies and 10,000 techniques often contradict one another. Note: *'the field of psychology today is literally a mess. There are as many techniques, methods and theories around as there are researchers and therapists'*.¹⁸⁶ Eminent thinker Karl Popper said of psychological theories, *'though posing as sciences, [they] had in fact more in common with primitive myths than science'*.¹⁸⁷ Different psychiatrists come to different conclusions about the same problem and have different approaches. Many have been discredited. Studies have shown that talking to loved ones produces a better result.

The success level is also very low: *'Volumes of research have been done to demonstrate the absolute unreliability of psychiatric diagnosis.'*¹⁸⁸ Why then would churches think that it is a good idea to adopt such a worldly strategy in the first place?

What developed was an industry of Christian counsellors who apply the notions of clinical psychologists as therapies for believers – Christian psychology. This often entails blaming problems upon difficulties in the past, especially in childhood. The result is that responsibility for sin is abrogated and a selfish desire for happiness, above all else, is fostered.

Then the basis of many psychologists is the need to develop self-esteem. The most popular theme in psychology is self-fulfilment, through high self-esteem and self-love. This is not a Biblical goal; indeed Jesus demanded self-denial. The issue of raising self-esteem is a major priority for James Dobson and many others. All sorts of methods are used to enable the patient to feel better about themselves and be positive. This is the opposite of Biblical teaching. Since many mental problems are caused by sin, the worst thing to do is encourage self-esteem. Jesus told us to deny ourselves and take up the cross (i.e. die to ourselves); those who are first are last etc. The apostolic message is 'when I am weak then I am strong'. Worldly principles are of no use at all when it comes to spiritual counselling.

¹⁸⁵ Until you start helping victims of CM abuses you cannot see the depth of damage done to vulnerable people. It is truly heartbreaking and wicked. Often the victims are young women; but even mature men have fallen foul of CM abuse, quite often geeky, mentally handicapped or socially challenged people.

¹⁸⁶ Bobgan, *Psychoheresy*, p31.

¹⁸⁷ Quoted in Bobgan, *ibid*, p37.

¹⁸⁸ Hugh Drummond, quoted in Bobgan, *Psychoheresy*, p146.

This is a huge subject that cannot be developed further here.¹⁸⁹

Women counsellors

Furthermore, many CM churches give over their counselling leadership to women. Thus women are given a place of significant authority over men in what is the basis of pastoral ministry. This is a grave sin and a denial of God's word (1 Tim 2:12). Often these women are accredited by some worldly authority, which is just an affirmation that they have studied worldly principles of psychology and psychiatry.¹⁹⁰

Inner healing techniques: healing of memories

There are various methodologies under this heading, but most of them are devoted to healing past emotional hurts through taking a person on a visionary journey into the past, where they see themselves being hurt, and changing something – this is all in the mind and utterly pointless.

One of the methods used in this is the occult practice of visualisation, or 'imagineering' (imagination engineering). One of the pioneers of this nonsense was Agnes Sanford who held that experience took priority over theology. This oriental technique of visualisation became the key to her inner healing teachings: one visualises a past problem, then imagines Jesus coming into that moment and resolving it. Sanford, who described God as a life-force of radiation energy that prompted a pantheistic evolution, was riddled with heresies and occult ideas. She even taught that one could forgive another's sins through visualisation and that people's minds are connected, which can be altered, even by travelling back in time.¹⁹¹ Sanford had an enormous influence on Charismatics and especially people like Ruth Carter Stapleton and John Wimber. Others developed new forms of inner healing, such as Theophostic Counselling.

Failure

Charismatic churches produce hordes of members that have various psychological problems, problems that never used to appear in simple historic churches where counsellors didn't exist. To resolve these multiple problems they have established many types of counselling to deal with these issues, whether deliverance ministry, inner healing or psychoheresy. All of the methods fail in the end because the problem is nothing to do with what the treatment rests upon. Often the real problem is sin that needs to be confessed and repented of. Instead Charismatics blame a demon or a memory or a lack of self-esteem.

I will give a personal example, something I rarely do. I was preaching at a church in Birmingham and was meeting people afterwards standing with two elders. A woman came up to me explaining that she was very troubled, distressed, depressed and that all previous counselling sessions had done no good at all. I asked if she could remember at specific time when this all began. She said she could. I then asked what else happened at that time. She told me that she had left her husband. I explained that she was suffering from guilt and first needed to put the matter straight regarding her marriage. She was visibly affected by this as the truth hit her. She realised the importance of her sin and left determined to get right, noticeably more peaceful.

¹⁸⁹ See the many works by Martin and Deirdre Bobgan on 'Psychoheresy'.

¹⁹⁰ Psychology, the study of the mind, is a genuine field of academic research. The Bible shows many examples of psychology in use. The problem is the world's development of psychological studies based upon occult, evolutionary and secular principles that dominate the academics.

¹⁹¹ Agnes Sanford, *The Healing Gifts of the Spirit*, Revell, (1983), p152.

Counselling is rarely complex and long winded if one can get at the truth. So often it is sin that causes emotional upset, but modern counselling techniques utterly fail to deal with this. Many practical problems, such as dealing with debt or getting divine guidance, are best solved in the body with people 'one-anothering'; but this requires proper access to peer fellowship, which the CM mostly discourages.

The CM has proved to be a complete failure at counselling or preparing people to deal with their own problems.

The failure to glorify Christ

This is the absolute worst failure of the CM churches. It is the chief reason why those who follow the CM will receive a very strict judgment at the Last Day.

The church is commanded to look to Christ and to make Christ pre-eminent – because he is God's pre-eminent person in the universe. Christ is above all and to him all men must bow the knee. Thus Christ must be first in the church and must be the main object of glory. Everything done must be centred in Christ – thus God's people, for example, must be cared for because they are the body of Christ; any neglect of the people of God is an offence to Christ.

The ways in which the CM fails to glorify Christ are multifarious; I will cover a few examples.

Truth

First and foremost is the issue of truth. Christ is the truth; the truth is in him. Thus a failure to concentrate upon the truth is a failure to focus upon Christ. Many CM leaders openly reject the truth in many ways.

Some abandoned the Bible as the church's authority, which is a rejection of Christ's word.¹⁹² Some rejected Biblical doctrine, which is a rejection of Christ's teaching, as found in his word.¹⁹³ Some brought in false teachings from elsewhere, which is a form of idolatry since it brings in a source of authority other than Christ.¹⁹⁴ Some asserted their own

¹⁹² Examples: 'God chasers don't want to just study from the mouldy pages of what God has done [i.e. the Bible]; they're anxious to see what God is doing.' Tommy Tenney; *The God Chasers*, Introduction. 'It is no more the primary purpose of the church to teach the scriptures than it is for British Rail to promote timetables.' Gerald Coates; *Evangelicals Now*, July 1996, quoted in *Contending Earnestly For the Faith*, 4.2, p8. 'The word will do you no good.' Paul Cain; speaking at the School of Prophecy, Anaheim, Nov 1989 session 7.

¹⁹³ Examples: 'I have problems with hell being eternal punishment.' Gerald Coates; *Evangelical Times*, Jan 93. 'Man was created on terms of equality with God.' Kenneth Hagin; *Berean Call*, June 1993. 'Faith is a force just like electricity or gravity ... we are a class of gods.' Kenneth Copeland; spoken on TBN TV programme with Paul Crouch. *Berean Call*, June 1993. 'Never go to the Lord and say, "If it be thy will ..." Don't allow such words to be spoken from your mouth.' Benny Hinn; *Berean Call*, June 1993.

¹⁹⁴ Examples: 'Unbelievers are being converted just through going out under the power of the Spirit.' John Arnott, Leader of Toronto Airport Church; *Sword & Trowel*, 1997 - 1, p31. 'Marching for Jesus is a prophetic act which demonstrates that the meek shall inherit the earth. Each footstep on the march is an action which claims the ground ... we are claiming it ... by shifting the spiritual powers that have been allocated in the nations.' Gerald Coates; *March For Jesus*, p131. 'How can we direct this great flow of life into a closed mind? By repenting not only of our own sins but of the sins of the world. By doing penance for the sins of the world, or for the sins of that particular world-leader for whom we would pray.' Agnes Sanford, *The Healing Light*, Macalester Park Pub. Co. (1948) p167.

authority and gave directions that simply came from them as men.¹⁹⁵ This is another form of idolatry and rebellion, being a rejection of Christ.

The CM utterly failed to defend the truth of Christ's word and thus failed to glorify Christ.

Worship

Worship is predominantly a personal matter, but when the saints come together they will worship because they are worshippers. Worship is essentially founded in submission to Christ as Lord; it is about bowing the knee and kissing the hand of a sovereign (that is the essential meaning of the Greek word for worship).

Worship has nothing to do with emotionalism; it is a matter of the will; the worshipper chooses to submit and reverence his Lord.

The chief problem with Charismatic worship is that it has little to do with personal submission or the will; it is mostly corporate emotionalism or even mysticism. CM worship is centred in a corporate activity on Sunday that is framed by loud music and singing banal songs that generate emotionalism; it is all about feelings. This is not worship.

In the worst examples, Charismatic worship strays beyond emotionalism into mysticism and from there into paganism. Much that passes as spiritual phenomena in CM worship times is nothing but pagan expressions of mysticism that have been around in false religion for centuries. It is this that produces irreverent behaviour, such as: screaming, shouting, animal noises falling down etc.

All of this fleshly emotionalism is a mockery of worship and it is a dead work of the old nature. In many cases it is the strange fire of idolatry where a leader, a desire or a feeling becomes the object of focus rather than Christ. In short, this behaviour is sin.

Caring for Christ's sheep

Christ is the true shepherd, the good shepherd and the people of God are his flock. In his grace Christ delegates his care to under-shepherds to pastor the flock; that is to protect them from wolves, feed them good things and care for their well being.

The CM has clearly failed in this matter, as we have discussed. In the worst cases, the sheep are not only neglected, but they are preyed upon and fleeced of their money to make leaders wealthy. This is a huge sin (Matt 18:6). Worse than that it is a blasphemy against Christ, who is the head of the body and the chief shepherd to whom leaders will answer on the Last Day.

Character

Everywhere you look at the CM, from nation to nation, from town to town, from top leadership to members, we see the same thing – lack of character. This is a failure of sanctification, which Christ's word tells us is the opposite of God's will for us.¹⁹⁶

195 Examples: 'Listen to the prophets — the little prophets, the big prophets, listen to those who speak one line and to those who speak volumes.' Glenn Foster; Prophecy published by the Sweetwater Church of the Valley; Life for the Nations, 7 October 1994. [End-time prophets] 'Possess the Spirit without measure. For they are the best of all the generations that have ever been on the face of the earth. ... They will move into things of the supernatural that no one has ever moved in before ... They'll move in the power that Christ did... They themselves will be the generation that's raised to put death itself underneath their feet.' Bob Jones, tape: Visions & Revelations (1988) quoted in David Cloud, The New Prophets, Way of Life Literature, Oak Harbour, Washington, p10.

The loose teaching and poor examples within the CM has led young people to care little about their growth in sanctification. Teachers have declared that masturbation is not a sin but a natural act. Leaders have taught that quiet times and giving thanks for food are legalism. Many leaders have modelled poor behaviour, such as: watching inappropriate movies, cheating the taxman, acting violently, swearing, blaspheming, threatening other believers, drinking to excess, failing to bring children up properly, and so on. These examples affect ordinary, everyday folk and I do not refer to the extreme unrighteousness of leadership scandals.

Now, to be fair, there are some righteous (but deceived) leaders in the CM and many decent folk in CM membership, but there is a far greater proportion of unrighteousness within the CM / Pentecostal churches than historic denominations.

Now the effect of this unrighteousness is a failure to glorify the Lord Jesus. The purpose of regeneration is to produce a body of people that glorify Christ in mind, word and deed. The lack of godly character in the CM is a failure to glorify Christ.

Centring upon money

We have already mentioned the failure of the CM to trust the Lord and its continual emphasis upon getting money. We have also mentioned the many CM leaders that have become rich on the backs of the sheep. We should also mention the constant teaching about getting money or upon the prosperity teachings of the Word Faith Movement within the CM. The historic Pentecostal churches have long had leaders claim that giving to their ministry would result in a return of a hundred-fold to a giver's bank account – a motivation for greed. All of this shows a wicked focus upon money and affluence, whether seeking it or gaining it.

The life and teachings of Jesus and the apostles could not be further from this. They all taught about the dangers of money and that the love of it was the root of all evil. They modelled modesty or even poverty of possessions and most of them never owned a single house, let alone a horse or a servant. On top of this they urged believers to give their money away in order to help those in need. Modern CM teachings are the very reverse of apostolic doctrine.

This is a terrible failure to glorify Christ. Indeed, the money grabbing antics of TV evangelists are the first cause of people in the world to castigate Christianity. Unbelievers see through these as charlatans and snake-oil salesmen and deride believers as gullible fools. I doubt that there is a greater cause of derision of the Lord Jesus in the modern world than that caused by TV evangelists.

Earthiness

One of the greatest failures of the CM is its concentration upon the things of this earth rather than the things above. We are clearly commanded by the Lord to look to the things above, to heaven where Christ is, to look to Christ (Col 3:1-3). The earth and its treasures are considered as sin and temptation and not something to trust in. We are to walk lightly upon this earth and avoid its contamination, seeking the washing of the water of the word to cleanse us from our feet walking upon it.

Everything about the CM is a focus upon the world and now. It no longer teaches that the hope of the Christian is heaven and that the treasures of the believer are kept in heaven for us (Matt 19:21; Lk 12:33; 1 Tim 6:18-19). Indeed, CM teachers often denigrate old-

196 1 Thess 4:3-4, 'For this is the will of God, your sanctification ... each of you should know how to possess his own vessel in sanctification and honour'.

fashioned preachers who taught ‘pie in the sky when you die’; and urge their disciples to gather treasures on earth.

Jesus specifically spoke on this matter thus:

Do not lay up for yourselves treasures on earth, where moth and rust destroy and where thieves break in and steal; but lay up for yourselves treasures in heaven, where neither moth nor rust destroys and where thieves do not break in and steal. For where your treasure is, there your heart will be also. Matt 6:19-21

Ignoring Jesus’ teaching, CM leaders have continually emphasised getting earthly wealth and possessions. Yonggi Cho even teaches his followers that they can have anything they want if they just claim it and visualise it in the manner of occult magic, except that he calls this faith. This is the worst extreme of CM earthiness where people are urged to claim for new cars, money, big homes and whatever they desire. God never promised us this.

But every aspect of CM strategies are earthly. By definition their teaching is that the kingdom has come to earth now and we do not have to wait for heaven to get what we want by spiritual power. Their mission strategy is earthly, being centred upon getting large numbers and using worldly means to do it (marketing, advertising, business models etc.). Their churches are earthly, being structured on worldly principles and copying commercial models. Their leadership is earthly and follows earthly hierarchical systems found in the military or despotic governments (which emanate from demonic structures). Their preaching is earthly, being based upon emotionalism, hypnotism, stage–presence and whipping up crowds into hysteria. We could go on and on. The CM is thoroughly based upon earthiness.

This is the very opposite of what Jesus commanded us to do and thus it is a massive failure to glorify Christ.

We could write a whole book on this subject, but this is enough for our purposes here.

Woe betides the CM for it offences to Christ the Lord.

The effect of 50 years of the CM on the UK church

Summary

CM factor	Modern reality
The Charismatic vision, especially for society.	A complete and utter failure. All the promises regarding society made decades ago have not only failed to come to pass but society is much worse.
Charismatic goals of evangelism and growth.	A complete failure of Biblical evangelism theology and practice. Growth is now stagnated and decline setting in.
Charismatic mission.	Missions are in decline and Charismatic mission is riddled with errors and problems.
The failure of personal spiritual development.	CM churches and leaders have utterly failed to edify and nurture their members, who remain spiritually stagnant, being fed lies, errors and propaganda.
The failure of community.	CM community is an utter failure. Most CM churches ruined fellowship by introducing hard, authoritarian, formal structures; however a minority of CM churches overemphasised community to the detriment of truth, reverence and godliness.
Charismatic giving.	CM tithing has led to a dramatic fall in charitable works and giving to the poor and needy. However, it has led to the growing affluence of church leaders; in some cases these have become fabulously rich. It has also wasted God’s resources on huge

	unnecessary buildings and staff.
Charismatic leadership.	CM leadership is riddled with scandals and errors. It has brought all sorts of evils upon God's people, such as cultism and authoritarianism.
Charismatic doctrine.	There has never been a time in history when so many heresies were in play all at the same time. This is almost completely the fault of the CM, which has become a Trojan Horse for paganism, mysticism and the occult.
The failure of CM eschatology.	All the claims of the victory of the church over the world have failed. The church is now struggling to survive.
Charismatic practices.	The CM has launched a multitude of aberrant practices upon the church.
Charismatic counselling.	The CM has brought a number of false counselling practices into the church, such as: authoritative women counsellors, deliverance ministry and psychoheresy.
The failure to glorify Christ.	The CM, with its focus upon men, fails to glorify Christ in a number of ways.

We could catalogue the serious damage that the CM has done to the church in Great Britain in many ways; indeed, many books have tackled this subject under a variety of headings. However, it is helpful to examine some of the problems caused in a simple tabular form. This exposes, at a glance, the tragedy that the CM has caused.

In almost every way it can be seen that the CM has had a very detrimental effect on the UK church within 50 years. For centuries the devil attacked the English church through persecution, political opposition, war, heresies big and small, the infiltration of cults and the splitting off of sects, papal anathemas, financial insecurity, social breakdown and so on. Far from ruining the church, English Protestantism grew stronger, becoming a bastion of sound theology that drew foreigners to her theological security and encouraged the world. Great men led churches, revivals, social works, political reforms and started foreign missions. The first Baptist missionary (William Carey) was sent out from England. The first western schools, universities, orphanages and hospitals were largely initiated through the work of English churchmen.¹⁹⁷ Some of the greatest ever preachers were ministers in English churches.

The work in other countries, that stood for centuries, was often begun by English ex-pats. The Pilgrim Fathers settled America and took the Puritan work ethic and Calvinistic church system that made America great. Many English missionaries gave their lives to establish the beginnings of a Christian church in hundreds of countries; often knowing a life of poverty, pain and persecution for their trouble.

Despite all that the devil threw at the English church, and no matter how much damage was initially done, the church re-grouped and grew stronger. Even the introduction of Arminianism by Jesuits through Archbishop Laud failed to gain a strong foothold for 400 years.

In the 20th century things began to change as the downgrade began. This was first accomplished by the prevalence of humanist ideas after the Enlightenment, and hastened after evolutionary theory gained a stronger foothold. Soon Liberal thinking led to Modernism and woolly theological thinking. The impact of evangelistic crusades, such as those by Moody and Sankey, prospered a rise of Arminian theology in the Gospel. Many other issues also did damage, from New Evangelicalism, the Holiness Movement, the

¹⁹⁷ I believe there was a university in Paris before Oxbridge.

World Council of Churches and Pentecostalism, to the mores of the ‘permissive society’. Yet none of these has managed to bring the utter devastation caused by the CM.

Within 50 years the CM has, essentially, wiped out sound, Biblical thinking and brought in a totally occult religious experience into evangelicalism. This was unthinkable to our Christian forbears, but it has happened step by step before our eyes. Doctrines, practices, methods, strategies, experiences and manifestations that are totally occult have been foisted upon gullible Christians who have been deceived into thinking that they are God working in power. The terrible delusions, doctrines of demons and deceitful methods that the Lord, Paul, Peter and John warned us about have all come to pass – and the means of this transmission of evil has been the Trojan Horse of the CM.

The tabular evaluation that follows seeks to itemise some of the indisputable changes. While some of this is subjective, all is based on experience and statistical studies found in many sources. References for all these points cannot be squeezed into this concise format here, but can be found by simple research if required.

Pre Charismatic Movement (Pre 1962)	Post Charismatic Movement
Missions	
Giving to foreign missions was high.	Giving to missions has dramatically diminished.
Volunteers to foreign missions were high.	Mission worker numbers have been seriously reduced. Some missions have folded completely, others are very stretched. There is now relatively little interest amongst Charismatics in this sort of work (unless it is a direct work of a particular CM church).
Reading missionary biographies was a key staple of discipleship.	Reading of the traditional biographies has almost vanished. Many Charismatic folk have never heard of CT Studd, Hudson Taylor, Robert Morrison, WC Burns, David Brainerd, William Carey, William Paton etc.
Charitable Works	
Giving to the poor and needy was high.	Charitable giving has dramatically dropped. Tithes are directed towards the CM work that people are part of. This is devoured by high salaries of leaders, upkeep of expensive modern and large buildings, and maintaining a huge office staff. It is rarely given to the poor.
Initiating new charitable works was a regular occurrence to meet every sort of need as it arose.	There are nowhere near enough ecclesiastical charity initiatives to cope with the massive scale of need in this country. Surveys today show that 60% of working families are struggling to make ends meet – and that is people with money. Homelessness and poverty (especially amongst children) is at an all-time high.
Bible Study	
Bible study was seen as a vital part of discipleship.	Many CM churches have almost abandoned Bibles let alone Bible study. Many Charismatics do not bother to take a personal Bible to church. Some leaders have dismissed the Bible as being irrelevant today or unimportant, preferring ‘prophecy’. It is rare to see a CM church having a mid-week Bible study. Sermons and messages are usually part of the indoctrination tools used by CM leaders to pass on strategies and their thoughts.

The use of Bible study tools was normal policy.	Few bother with Bible study tools. In fact few read much at all. They just accept whatever their leader and his colleagues tell them without examination.
Sermons and counselling were directed to passing on resources and methods to understand the Bible better. Whole courses were devoted to understanding Scripture.	Sermons are now tools for brainwashing in many places with hardly a reference to Scripture. Thus false doctrines are easily infiltrated upon the people. If it is not to generate money, a sermon is used to push a strategy. Very few even expound Scripture regularly.
Doctrinal Understanding	
After the turn of the end of the 19 th century doctrinal understanding diminished in the onslaught of modernism, liberalism, evolutionary theory and new evangelicalism. However, there was still a reasonable understanding of theology and theological issues. This was revived in the 1950s-60s by the publishing of many Reformed and Puritan books, the establishment of Reformed magazines and the ministry of several men such as Martyn Lloyd-Jones.	Currently, doctrinal understanding is at an all-time low. The poverty of theological grasp is absolutely shocking. The prevalence of many heretical doctrines is intensely worrying. Indeed, there are more heresies abounding amongst the churches today than at any time in history. All the historical heresies that have appeared in history over 2,000 years are now all appearing at the same time. This even applies to Docetism, which was thought long-dead and utterly foolish.
Few, in the church, entertained seriously false doctrines. Denials of the Trinity were found outside evangelicalism in the sects.	Unbelievable heresies are now pushed from the pulpit. One famous CM leader teaches that there are 9 gods; another that there are seven Spirits. Many Pentecostals deny the Trinity.
Mature believers could give, at least, a summary explanation of the major doctrines.	Most people in the CM today do not even know what the proper Gospel is and have no clue how to explain justification, election, sanctification, eschatology etc.
Confessions, creeds and catechisms were still being used, at least in Reformed churches of various stripes.	These have been virtually abandoned by all. Only a very few small Reformed churches have any sort of credal instruction. Catechising is said to be divisive.
All churches adopted some form of confessional stance.	Most churches, and probably all CM churches, have no form of confessional stance, or at least only a weak and watery summary position.
A strong stance was adopted in the face of current theological issues. For instance, the open platform and ecumenical method of Billy Graham was strongly combated by many conservative churches.	CM and many other evangelical churches take no strong doctrinal stance on modern issues. Note the ecumenical flavour of the Alpha Course adopted by all, even Roman Catholics. Moral issues are more likely to be an issue today instead of theological issues (such as abortion).
Ecumenism	
Ecumenical policies were strongly contested by most conservative churches.	The CM has been a tool for the adoption and advancement of ecumenical issues. Indeed, the key policies of the CM have been stalking horses to lead conservatives into ecumenical works by stealth, such as: healings, signs & wonders, a weak Gospel based on man's will, the shared baptism in the Spirit experience etc.
Ecumenical jamborees were resisted by conservative churches.	Ecumenical jamborees have been developed by the CM; such as: Praise Marches, Bible Weeks, the Alpha Course events, Signs & Wonders conferences etc. At (at least) one Praise March, evangelicals walked singing choruses next to nuns singing praises to Mary. At one Brighton Signs and Wonders conference a side meeting celebrated Mass, officiated by monks, attended by several national CM leaders.
The use of money and property	
Most churches did not have large sums of money to play	CM churches have enormous sums of money. The

with.	umbrella organisations (usually run by a so-called apostle) have even larger sums to play with. Many of the larger CM churches have become multi-million pound business.
Many ministers would struggle on poor salaries, but were spiritually empowered.	Salaries pegged to professionals have now become the norm. Leaders with no other experience earn huge sums that they could never hope for in the commercial world (this is what traps disaffected leaders in the system).
Tax rules were strictly adhered to.	Tax avoidance is carefully studied. There have been cases of fraud. Many adopted very shoddy policies, such as paying wives of leaders up to the maximum allowed under tax rules to reduce the tax payment of the minister. In the 1980s this could add £2,000 to a leader's salary without any extra payment of tax.
Buildings were either handed down historically or were small venues with low maintenance. Many dissenting chapels (especially Brethren and Strict Baptist) were little more than huts.	Large CM churches tend to purchase warehouses out of town, sometimes at the cost of over a million pounds. It also results in paying high business rates. Maintenance costs of these is very high since they were not meant to be used for large numbers of people but chiefly for storage of goods. For instance, fire regulations are very different and more strict (hence more costly), especially where children and crèches are involved. Refurbishment and refitting for church use is also very costly. All this is a waste of the Lord's money.
Moral Standards	
While there are always individual cases of moral lapse, in general the standard of moral behaviour in conservative churches was high; at least outwardly.	The situation in the CM and associated works is shocking. There are many high-level cases of terrible moral lapse (such as confession of alcoholism, homosexuality, fornication, use of prostitutes, drug-abuse etc.). In general there is an appalling standard of behaviour amongst congregations, especially the youth. Bible Weeks have been hotbeds of fornication, people feel free to cheat their employer, fiddle their tax return, use bad language, go clubbing, get drunk, indulge in revelry and so on. All these are prohibited by apostolic teaching.
Personal appearance at church meetings was sober and respectable.	Anything goes now. It is very common for even adults to arrive at summer church gatherings in shorts, gaudy t-shirts and barefoot. Even social drinking clubs today ban such appearance, but the CM has no problem.
Worship	
Most dissenting churches accompanied songs by an acoustic piano, a small organ, or occasionally an additional acoustic guitar. Choirs in independent churches were anathema and seen as institutional and emotional.	The CM gradually introduced whole rock bands and choirs (from a group of backing singers to ranks of many singers) to worship. Loud, raucous, driven music is now vital. Drums dominate the rhythm. Even in quiet songs there is the backing of keyboards, drums, electric & acoustic guitars, backing singers, and other instruments as available,
In most cases music was in the background and sometimes not present at all.	Worship is unthinkable without instrumental music dominating the proceedings.
No PA, or one microphone for the speaker for the hard of hearing.	Large PA systems predominate.
Hymn books.	Computer based projections are used for songs.
Worship was sober and reverent.	Worship is irreverent, fleshly, worldly.
Worship was focused on God without feelings.	Worship is dominated by feelings and focused on man's emotional pleasure.

Worship was submission to God.	Worship is entertainment of man.
Praise was sober.	Praise is exuberant and fleshly.
Physical expressions were minimal.	Physical expressions are often ostentatious and exaggerated. In radical cases there are extreme physical manifestations which are utterly occult but pass as power from God. Dancing is common.
Falling over was unheard of, except in some sects.	Swathes of hundreds of people falling backwards is common in many CM circles. Some ministries are devoted to performing this occult hypnotic feat.
Excessive behaviour was checked and removed.	Excessive behaviour is encouraged and seen as evidence of God at work.
Pastoral Work	
Pastors were usually on their own and pressurised. In some cases deacons shared the burden. [These are not Biblical situations.] In many cases there was a senior pastor with a team of elders.	Pastoral team is usually large comprising of full-time men and part-time leaders of various sorts. There is no Biblical basis for the salaried men unless they also have an itinerant ministry or preach very frequently.
Pastors were approachable.	Leaders are often held in undue authority. In many cases they are not very approachable, with most personal pastoral work being done by working men at a more local level. I have even heard of leaders who do not answer letters, let alone see people.
Pastors were rarely heavy-handed.	Heavy shepherding is still in evidence. Authoritarian leaders dominate the CM. Often there are examples of spiritual abuse.
Pastoral counselling was always done by the pastor, or perhaps delegated to an elder – always male.	Many CM churches have their own counselling teams that are usually staffed and led by women. These are often trained in secular psychiatry or psychology and thus spout the occult ideas of Freud or Jung etc.
Exorcism was unheard of, except in obscure sects.	Exorcism (deliverance) is now so common that there are whole ministries devoted to this and nothing else.
Pastors were often relatively poor. [This is unbiblical. Pastors should be level with their pastorate.]	CM leaders are almost always very well paid. Indeed, some leaders lead luxurious or opulent life-styles.
Pastors dominated the meeting. [This is unbiblical.]	Leaders still dominate the meeting, but worship leaders dominate one half while speakers dominate the other.
General Leadership	
Women leaders were unheard of in evangelical churches.	Women leaders, of all sorts, are now common in the CM. This even applies to 'apostles'.
The most common system was a single leading pastor / minister possibly with an eldership team.	We now have a multiplicity of leadership jobs, none of which are Scriptural (apart from elders).
Office staff were unheard of, apart from a few minor helps (such as an unpaid secretary).	CM churches have a large office staff comprising all sorts of functions.
Rank authoritarianism was rare, even though some churches had an authoritative system (a single pastor).	Most CM churches are authoritarian. In many CM churches apostles have absolute authority passed on through tiers (pyramidal) of hierarchy.
Spiritual abuse (detrimental leadership domination) was rare.	Spiritual abuse is so common that book after book has been devoted to this subject alone.

Conclusion: the CM is the work of men not of God

The great sins of the CM are:

- Being a Trojan Horse to carry all sorts of doctrinal and practical errors into the church.

- The introduction of many forms of paganism into the church.
- The introduction of many forms of occultism into the church.
- Diverting the attention of the saints on to men, especially an elite, rather than Christ.
- Focusing attention on life now rather than the hope of eternal life in a restored world.
- Emphasising emotionalism and mysticism rather than spirituality.
- Damaging the body of Christ in many ways.

Of these, the most pervasive and all-encompassing is centring upon men. By doing this it has taught wrong doctrine, introduced aberrant practices, developed mysticism, and damaged the body. When a church focuses upon a man and gives unswerving allegiance to that man, it is then susceptible to any error that man falls prey to. All the devil has to do is tempt one man and he will ensnare a whole church. Such foolishness is a recipe for disaster – and so it has proved. It is for good reason that God’s command is church leadership of a team of equal elders, not a pyramid hierarchy.

Having worked, in the early days, with a so-called apostle for several years, with whom I sometimes travelled, I saw how this worked out first-hand. The apostle started out as a good man with an evangelistic gift; someone who should never have been a church leader let alone leader of many churches. Due to his inner insecurities, as the years went on he became victim of error after error, due to mixing with various international CM leaders. Thus he would bring back to the church this doctrine, that practice and certain leaders to preach in the church. Error after error was taken up in the church; each of which came from some other man, which was copied by the ‘apostle’. Often a practice would fail and fall into disuse but there was never any apology or repentance and mistakes were never mentioned. Each year it was fashion after fashion, fad after fad, that crept into the church, continually causing pastoral problems when they failed. Eventually I confronted this man to his face, put down leadership and later left the church completely. As for the ‘apostle’ he continued to prosper and gain more fame. His work now comprises hundreds of churches worldwide.

Thus the work of the CM is fleshly; it is old nature activity. It is even very often Old Covenant religion. It is a human dominated matter, which fails to glorify Christ.

The CM is a complete failure.

Appendix One

The victory of Latter Rain theology in the CM

What was once scandalised, heretical, outlawed, Pentecostal doctrine re-appeared, through the Sign and Wonders Movement, in the CM (and especially the Restoration churches) in its second flowering. What was once a localised, discredited initiative became an international church phenomenon because the CM brought it to the world stage and endorsed it.

The key tenets of Latter Rain now found in the radical CM

God is restoring the church to its original power, perfection and glory.

Comment: this is the basis of CM Restorationism. It is a striving after a perceived idealistic glory in the early church while ignoring the constant afflictions, hardships and persecutions. It is an excuse for fleshly triumphalism and the use of occult phenomena. It centres upon the victory of the church in the world today, ignoring Scripture which tells us that at the end there is a great falling away in the church and that the church always suffers tribulation.

The restoration of Apostles and Prophets to head the church; pastors, teachers and evangelists all function under them. Believers must submit to these ministries, confess their sins to men, accept personal prophecies and leading.

Comment: this is just the introduction of 'inspired' authoritarian hierarchies into the church as opposed to the simple Biblical precedent of a team of equal elders. Even Paul never ruled over his own planted churches but had to plead with them and persuade them to correct issues.

Restoration of all the supernatural gifts of the Holy Spirit - with an emphasis on prophets and prophecy.

Comment: an emphasis upon the supposedly supernatural gifts, with no genuine Biblical exposition about them. Thus tongues (which all agree ceased in the first 100 years) is re-introduced with no explanation why and no reason given for its difference to Biblical tongues (then - unlearned human languages; now - gibberish). The word of knowledge is defined as prescience instead of doctrinal instruction by teachers. Really the only gifts they are interested in are supposedly supernatural ones (tongues, inspired prophecy, healing, miracles, prescience). The rest of 28 gifts mentioned in Scripture are ignored.

The use of the laying on of hands to impart the Spirit, healing and spiritual gifts.

Comment: this is straight from Branham but is accepted as orthodox by all CM people. The fact is that we don't see this normally used to give gifts in Acts; it happened occasionally for specific reasons. Many people received the Spirit without having hands laid on them (e.g. Acts 2:38, 10:44).

Women given equal roles in authority in the Church.

Comment: this is in direct contradiction to very clear Scriptures that women cannot teach or have authority over men – in any format (i.e. preaching or worship leading).

Casting out demons from Christians.

Comment: there is no Biblical authority for exorcising Christians. Sin and character problems are never said to be caused by demons and there is no such thing as 'deliverance ministry' in the Bible.

Rebuilding the physical Tabernacle of David.

I.e. continual 'prophetic' praise before the Lord; a focus upon raucous praise backed by loud bands. Comment: the NT gives no instruction on instrumental music in church meetings of any kind and it never appeared in apostolic churches or even the sub-apostolic church. Instrumental music was not widespread in Catholicism until 1250. Even in the 19th century many Reformed and Baptist churches still had no music. Calvin, Luther and Spurgeon had no instrumental music.

The dominion of the world by The Church

Comment: this is in direct contradiction to the prophecies of the NT about the end, where the church is plainly said to be persecuted by the world. Latter Rain is triumphalist and dominionist – forms of hopeful postmillennialism (although the original Latter Rain teachers were Premillennial, but taught the victory of the church before a millennium).

The defeat of physical death by ascended believers called Manifest Sons of God

Comment: this is just plain occultism and flat denial of the Bible's teaching. It seeks to give believers powers that are only available to Christ (although even he needed to die and be resurrected). Denial of the need for resurrection is a cardinal error.

Unity of the Body, i.e. all churches submitting the Apostolic and Prophetic authority

Comment: This is just global cultism and ecumenism. It is the corollary of the apostolic church ruling the world; the apostolic church will also dominate all other churches. Later Latter Rain exponents went so far as to say that apostolic churches would wage war on those Christians who refused to submit to them, killing them.

Scripture quotations are from The New King James Version
© Thomas Nelson 1982

Paul Fahy Copyright © 2013/16
Understanding Ministries
<http://www.understanding-ministries.com>